

**Book of Abstracts**

**The Art Market and the**

# Global South

**New Perspectives and Plural Approaches**

**The 2019 TIAMSA Conference**

**Lisbon 21-24 November**



**Book of Abstracts**

**The Art Market and the**

# *Global South*

**New Perspectives and Plural Approaches**

**The 2019 TIAMSA Conference**

**Lisbon 21-24 November**

**Legal disclaimer:** The content of each abstracts is the sole responsibility of the respective authors who also retain the copyright for their contributions to this booklet.

## **Copyright page**

### **Title**

The Art Market and the Global South: New Perspectives and Plural Approaches. Book of Abstracts

### **Organization**

Institute of Art History, School of Social Sciences and Humanities, Universidade NOVA de Lisboa

TIAMSA – The International Art Market Studies Association

UFRGS – Universidade Federal do Rio Grande do Sul

### **Editors**

Institute of Art History, School of Social Sciences and Humanities, Universidade NOVA de Lisboa

Lisbon, 2019

## Conference

---

### Organizing Committee

---

Adelaide Duarte ▪ Universidade Nova de Lisboa, Portugal; TIAMSA Subcommittee AMC\_PSB

Bruna Fetter ▪ Universidade Federal do Rio Grande do Sul, Brazil; TIAMSA Subcommittee AMC\_PSB

Fernando Loureiro Bastos ▪ Universidade de Lisboa, Portugal; TIAMSA Subcommittee AMC\_PSB; TIAMSA Legal

Marcílio Franca Filho ▪ Universidade Federal da Paraíba, Brazil; TIAMSA Subcommittee AMC\_PSB; TIAMSA Legal

Maria Amélia Bulhões ▪ Universidade Federal do Rio Grande do Sul, Brazil; TIAMSA Subcommittee AMC\_PSB

Marta Perez Ibañez ▪ Independent Researcher; TIAMSA Subcommittee AMC\_PSB

Veronika Korbei ▪ TIAMSA - The International Art Market Studies Association

### Scientific Committee

---

Alain Queminn ▪ Université Paris-8, France

Ana Letícia Fialho ▪ Universidade Federal de São Paulo, Brazil

Dorothee Wimmer ▪ Technische Universität Berlin, Germany

Filip Vermeylen ▪ Erasmus University Rotterdam, Netherlands

George Kornis ▪ Universidade Estadual do Rio de Janeiro, Brazil

Isidro Lopez-Aparicio ▪ Universidad de Granada, Spain

Johannes Nathan ▪ TIAMSA – The International Art Market Studies Association; Technische Universität Berlin, Germany

Juan Arturo Rubio Arostegui ▪ Universidad Nebrija, Spain

Luís Urbano Afonso ▪ Universidade de Lisboa, Portugal

Nathalie Moureau ▪ Université Paul Valéry Montpellier, France

Olav Velthuis ▪ University of Amsterdam, Netherlands

Paolo Serafini ▪ Università La Sapienza, Roma, Italy

Raquel Henriques da Silva ▪ Universidade Nova de Lisboa, Portugal

## **Executive Committee**

---

Frederico Duarte ▪ IHA/NOVA FCSH

## **Organization**

---

Institute of Art History, School of Social Sciences and Humanities, Universidade NOVA de Lisboa

TIAMSA – The International Art Market Studies Association

UFRGS – Universidade Federal do Rio Grande do Sul

## **Sponsors**

---

Palácio do Correio Velho – Leilões e Antiguidades, S.A.

Museu Nacional de Arte Antiga

# Content

## Introduction

---

## Programme

---

## Abstracts

---

### Keynote Speakers

---

#### How Contemporary Art Markets Are Made in the Global South

Olav Velthuis ▪ University of Amsterdam, Netherlands

#### Contemporary Art Markets in Latin America: Internationalization in Disequilibrium

Ana Letícia Fialho ▪ Universidade Federal de São Paulo, Brazil

### Speakers

---

#### Section 1 | The Global South: The Local Markets and the Dynamics of the Global Art Market ..... 21

#### Leading Countries, the «Global South» and the Rest of the World: Reconsidering Categories through a Ranking of International Contemporary Art Galleries

Alain Quemin ▪ Université Paris-8, France

#### No compass. Neither South nor North: Between Parintins and Phnom Penh

Alexandre Melo ▪ ISCTE-IUL, Portugal

#### Analyzing the International Art Trade from the Global South Perspective

Joanna Bialynicka-Birula ▪ Department of Market Analysis and Marketing Research, Cracow University of Economics, Poland

#### Contemporary Art, the Market, and the Global South

Idalina Conde ▪ CIES/ISCTE-IUL, Portugal

#### Section 2 | Southern Markets, Plural Markets, New Markets ..... 26

#### Comparing Internationalization Patterns Toward Emerging Markets for Contemporary Art: The cases of Art Basel in Miami and Hong Kong

Elisabetta Lazzaro ▪ HKU University of the Arts Utrecht, Netherlands

Nathalie Moureau ▪ Université Paul Valéry Montpellier 3, France

**Oasis in the Desert: Nigeria as an Evolving Hub of the African Contemporary Art Market**

Jonathan Adeyemi ▪ Queen's University Belfast, United Kingdom

**The Ljubljana Biennial of Graphic Arts and Its Socioeconomic Context: Capitalist vs. Socialist Art Markets**

Petja Grafenauer ▪ Academy of Fine Arts, University of Ljubljana, Slovenia

Nataša Ivanović ▪ Academy of Fine Arts, University of Ljubljana, Slovenia

Andrej Srakar ▪ Institute for Economic Research (IER); Faculty of Economics, University of Ljubljana, Slovenia

**Chinese Contemporary Export Art: 1989-2019**

Iain Robertson ▪ Sotheby's Institute of Art, London, United Kingdom

**Network and Structure: Mapping the Museum Valorization in Chinese Emerging Contemporary Art**

Simeng Chang ▪ Erasmus University Rotterdam, Netherlands; Burgundy School of Business, France

**Art as Alchemy: Reframing the 'Work' of Art in the Global South**

David Challis ▪ Melbourne University, Australia

**Section 3 | The Collecting Process. Models, New Collectors and New Private Museums ..... 33**

**Asian Art Collectors and Their Role in Markets of Contemporary Art**

Melanie Fasche ▪ Sotheby's Institute of Art, London, United Kingdom

**Philanthropists and Patrons – A New Future for the Indian Contemporary Art Market**

Georgina Bexon ▪ Royal Society of Arts and Royal Asiatic Society, United Kingdom

**Perspectives of Contemporary Art Collecting in Brazil**

Nei Vargas da Rosa ▪ Federal University of Rio Grande do Sul, Brazil

**The Fantastic Voyage: The History of Collecting from Pre-Modern Assyria until Contemporaneity in Six Typologies (Psychologists and Sociologists Please Abstain!)**

Paco Barragán ▪ University of Salamanca, Spain

**Section 4 | Agents in the Market: Circulation and Friction in the Art System ..... 38**

**Shifts in Consecration Power of and for African Players in Global Art Play**

Michael Hutter ▪ Institute of Sociology, Technische Universität Berlin, Germany; Berlin Social Science Center (WZB)

**A Dealer's Work: Creating Value, Creating Narratives**

Olga Sooudi ▪ Department of Anthropology, University of Amsterdam, Netherlands

**Clara Diament Sujo: Dealing with 'Art of the Americas' in Venezuela and the US**

Ana Avelar ▪ University of Brasília, Brazil

**Placing Art in the Global Art Market: Status, Practices and Networks of Brazilian Art Galleries in a Transnational Cultural Field**

Amanda Brandellero ▪ Department of Arts and Culture Studies, Erasmus University, Rotterdam, Netherlands

**Singapore and the Construction of a Southeast Asian Art Market**

Jérémie Molho ▪ Robert Schuman Centre for Advanced Studies, European University Institute, Florence, Italy

**Global [South] Ambition: The Role of Art Auctions in the Strategic Positioning of Singapore and 'Southeast Asian Art'**

Anita Archer ▪ Melbourne University, Australia

**How Validation Patterns Have Limited South-Centricity in the Contemporary African Art Ecology**

Mary Corrigan ▪ Independent Scholar, South Africa

**Is the Art Market Biased? Women Artists in the Spanish Art Market**

Carolina Rodvalho ▪ Independent Scholar, Spain

**Section 5 | The Legal Regime of the Purchase and Sale of Works of Art, Due Diligence and the Rights of the Artists ..... 46**

**Restitutions and Art Markets in the Global South: Analyzing the Implications of the Sarr-Savoy Report for African Art Markets**

Sarah Hegenbart ▪ Technical University, Munich, Germany  
Philipp Nuernberger ▪ Attorney, LL.M., New York, USA

**The Concept of Due Diligence for Cultural Property Transactions in the 1995 UNIDROIT and 1970 UNESCO Conventions**

Alicja Jagielska-Burduk ▪ UNESCO Chair on Cultural Property Law, University of Opole, Poland  
Claudia Quiñones ▪ Attorney, Amineddoleh & Associates, New York, USA

**Inadequacy and Insufficiency of Brazilian Law on Droit de Suite and the Advantages of a Universal Resale Royalty Right for the Global South**

Mariana Vogelaar Carlucci ▪ Universidade de São Paulo, Brazil

**Private Collections and Private Museums in Polish Law**

Żaneta Gwardzińska ▪ UNESCO Chair on Cultural Property Law, University of Opole, Poland

**Section 6 | The Crisis: Impact and Strategies ..... 52**

**Strategies of Collectivization: Art Market Alternatives from the Global South**

John Zarobell ▪ University of San Francisco, USA

**The Double-Edged Sword of Prestige: A Network Analytic Approach to the Cooperation among Art Organizations in Bogotá's Emerging Art Scene**

Annatina Aerne ▪ University of St.Gallen, Switzerland

**A Study on Art Funds in China: Features, Values and Limits**

Linli Li ▪ School of Art and Design, Guangdong University of Technology, China

**Mola: Documenting Artist-Run Spaces**

Vera Carmo ▪ Colégio das Artes da Universidade de Coimbra (UC) and Instituto Universitário da Maia (ISMAI), Portugal

**The Reinvention of the Business Model of a Major Portuguese Auction House**

Luís Urbano Afonso ▪ School of Arts of the University of Lisbon, Portugal

Alexandra Fernandes ▪ ISCTE-IUL, Portugal

Loizos Petrides ▪ ISCTE-IUL, Portugal

# Introduction

This conference, co-organized by the Institute of Art History, School of Social Sciences and Humanities, Universidade NOVA de Lisboa, TIAMSA – The International Art Market Studies Association and the TIAMSA Subcommittee Art Market and Collecting: Portugal, Spain and Brazil, and Universidade Federal do Rio Grande do Sul, intends to discuss the developments, the disruptions and new perspectives that can be observed in the current art market as seen from the Global South, a term here used to refer to emerging economies of the southern hemisphere (South America, Africa, India, South-Eastern Asia, Southern Europe, but not limited to these geographical areas) and their contribution to the development of art markets worldwide.

# *Programme*

# Thursday 21 November

---

**8:45**

**Registration**

**09:30 – 09:45**

**Welcome**

**Johannes Nathan**, TIAMSA; Technische Universität, Berlin, Germany

**Adelaide Duarte**, IHA/NOVA FCSH, Lisbon, Portugal

**09:45 – 10:30 KEYNOTE ADDRESS**

**Olav Velthuis**, University of Amsterdam, Netherlands

*“How Contemporary Art Markets Are Made in the Global South”*

**10:30 – 10:45**

**Discussion followed by Coffee Break**

---

## **Section 1: The Global South: The Local Markets and the Dynamics of the Global Art Market**

**Chair: Veronika Korbei**, TIAMSA

**11:10 – 11:30**

**Alain Quemin**, Université Paris-8, France

*“Leading Countries, the «Global South» and the Rest of the World: Reconsidering Categories through a Ranking of International Contemporary Art Galleries”*

**11:30 – 11:50**

**Alexandre Melo**, ISCTE-IUL, Portugal

*“No Compass. Neither South nor North: Between Parintins and Phnom Penh”*

**11:50 – 12:10**

**Joanna Bialynicka-Birula**, Department of Market Analysis and Marketing Research, Cracow University of Economics, Poland

*“Analyzing the International Art Trade from the Global South Perspective”*

**12:10 – 12:30**

**Idalina Conde**, CIES/ISCTE-IUL, Portugal

*“Contemporary Art, the Market, and the Global South”*

**12:30 – 12:45**

**Discussion followed by Lunch Break**

---

## **Section 2 - Part 1: Southern Markets, Plural Markets, New Markets**

**Chair: Filipa Oliveira**, Diretora Artística da Casa da Cerca - Centro de Arte Contemporânea Almada

**14:30 – 14:50**

**Elisabetta Lazzaro**, HKU University of the Arts Utrecht, Netherlands

**Nathalie Moureau**, Université Paul Valéry Montpellier 3, France

*“Comparing Internationalization Patterns Toward Emerging Markets for Contemporary Art: The cases of Art Basel in Miami and Hong Kong”*

**14:50 – 15:10**

**Jonathan Adeyemi**, Queen’s University Belfast, United Kingdom

*“Oasis in the Desert: Nigeria as an Evolving Hub of the African Contemporary Art Market”*

**15:10 – 15:30**

**Petja Grafenauer**, Academy of Fine Arts, University of Ljubljana, Slovenia

**Nataša Ivanović**, Academy of Fine Arts, University of Ljubljana, Slovenia

**Andrej Srakar**, Institute for Economic Research (IER); Faculty of Economics, University of Ljubljana, Slovenia

*“The Ljubljana Biennial of Graphic Arts and Its Socioeconomic Context: Capitalist vs. Socialist Art Markets”*

**15:30 – 15:45**

**Discussion followed by Long Coffee Break**

## Section 2 - Part 2: Southern Markets, Plural Markets, New Markets

**Chair: Luís Urbano Afonso**, Departamento de História/Artis - Instituto de História da Arte, Faculdade de Letras da Universidade de Lisboa

**16:25 – 16:45**

**Iain Robertson**, Sotheby's Institute of Art, London, United Kingdom  
*"Chinese Contemporary Export Art: 1989-2019"*

**16:45 – 17:05**

**Simeng Chang**, Erasmus University Rotterdam, Netherlands; Burgundy School of Business, France  
*"Network and Structure: Mapping the Museum Valorization in Chinese Emerging Contemporary Art"*

**17:05 – 17:25**

**David Challis**, Melbourne University, Australia  
*"Art as Alchemy: Reframing the 'Work' of Art in the Global South"*

**17:25 – 17:40**

**Discussion**

**18:30 – 19:30**

**Special Event**

optional, registration required by 31 Oct, see [tinyurl.com/y54c9gbc](https://tinyurl.com/y54c9gbc)

**Joana Vasconcelos Studio**

Edifício Gonçalves Zarco, Rua da Cintura do Porto de Lisboa, Doca de Alcântara Norte 1350-352 Lisboa, Portugal

## Friday 22 November

---

### Section 3: The Collecting Process. Models, New Collectors and New Private Museums

**Chair: Adelaide Duarte**, IHA/NOVA FCSH; TIAMSA-AMC\_PSB

**09:30 – 09:50**

**Melanie Fasche**, Sotheby's Institute of Art, London, United Kingdom  
*"Asian Art Collectors and Their Role in Markets of Contemporary Art"*

**09:50 – 10:10**

**Georgina Bexon**, Royal Society of Arts and Royal Asiatic Society, United Kingdom  
*"Philanthropists and Patrons – A New Future for the Indian Contemporary Art Market"*

**10:10 – 10:30**

**Nei Vargas da Rosa**, Federal University of Rio Grande do Sul, Brazil  
*"Perspectives of Contemporary Art Collecting in Brazil"*

**10:30 – 10:50**

**Paco Barragán**, University of Salamanca, Spain  
*"The Fantastic Voyage: The History of Collecting from Pre-Modern Assyria until Contemporaneity in Six Typologies (Psychologists and Sociologists Please Abstain!)"*

**10:50 – 11:05**

**Discussion followed by Coffee Break**

## Section 4 - Part 1: Agents in the Market: Circulation and Friction in the Art System

Chair: **Helena Barranha**, Instituto Superior Técnico, Universidade de Lisboa; Institute of Art History, School of Social Sciences and Humanities, Universidade NOVA de Lisboa

**11:25 – 11:45**

**Michael Hutter**, Institute of Sociology, Technische Universität Berlin, Germany; Berlin Social Science Center (WZB)  
*“Shifts in Consecration Power of and for African Players in Global Art Play”*

**11:45 – 12:05**

**Olga Sooudi**, Department of Anthropology, University of Amsterdam, Netherlands  
*“A Dealer’s Work: Creating Value, Creating Narratives”*

**12:05 – 12:25**

**Ana Avelar**, University of Brasília, Brazil  
*“Clara Diamant Sujo: Dealing with ‘Art of the Americas’ in Venezuela and the US”*

**12:25 – 12:45**

**Amanda Brandellero**, Department of Arts and Culture Studies, Erasmus University, Rotterdam, Netherlands  
*“Placing Art in the Global Art Market: Status, Practices and Networks of Brazilian Art Galleries in a Transnational Cultural Field”*

**12:45 – 13:00**

**Discussion followed by Lunch Break**

**13:15 – 14:15**

**TIAMSA Groups Round Table**  
optional, no registration required

---

## Section 4 - Part 2: Agents in the Market: Circulation and Friction in the Art System

Chair: **Juan Arturo Rubio Arostegui**, Universidad Nebrija, Spain

**14:30 – 14:50**

**Jérémie Molho**, Robert Schuman Centre for Advanced Studies, European University Institute, Florence, Italy  
*“Singapore and the Construction of a Southeast Asian Art Market”*

**14:50 – 15:10**

**Anita Archer**, Melbourne University, Australia  
*“Global [South] Ambition: The Role of Art Auctions in the Strategic Positioning of Singapore and ‘Southeast Asian Art’”*

**15:10 – 15:30**

**Mary Corrigan**, Independent Scholar, South Africa  
*“How Validation Patterns Have Limited South-Centricity in the Contemporary African Art Ecology”*

**15:30 – 15:50**

**Carolina Rodvalho**, Independent Scholar, Spain  
*“Is the Art Market Biased? Women Artists in the Spanish Art Market.”*

**15:50 – 16:05**

**Discussion followed by Coffee Break**

## Section 5: The Legal Regime of The Purchase and Sale of Works of Art, Due Diligence and the Rights of the Artists

Chair: **Fernando Loureiro Bastos**, Universidade de Lisboa; TIAMSA-AMC\_PSB; TIAMSA Legal

**16:25 – 16:45**

**Sarah Hegenbart**, Technical University, Munich, Germany

**Philipp Nuernberger**, Attorney, LL.M. New York, USA

*“Restitutions and Art Markets in the Global South: Analysing the Implications of the Sarr-Savoy Report for African Art Markets”*

**16:45 – 17:05**

**Alicja Jagielska-Burduk**, UNESCO Chair on Cultural Property Law, University of Opole, Poland

**Claudia Quiñones**, Attorney, Amineddoleh & Associates, New York, USA

*“The Concept of Due Diligence for Cultural Property Transactions in the 1995 UNIDROIT and 1970 UNESCO Conventions”*

**17:05 – 17:25**

**Mariana Vogelaar Carlucci**, Universidade de São Paulo, Brazil

*“Inadequacy and Insufficiency of Brazilian Law on Droit de Suite and the Advantages of a Universal Resale Royalty Right for the Global South”*

**17:25 – 17:45**

**Żaneta Gwardzińska**, UNESCO Chair on Cultural Property Law, University of Opole, Poland

*“Private Collections and Private Museums in Polish Law”*

**17:45 – 18:00**

**Discussion**

**20:00 – 22:30**

Dinner – Open to all, registration required by 10 Nov, see [tinyurl.com/yyampwbw](https://tinyurl.com/yyampwbw)

## Saturday 23 November

### Section 6: The Crisis: Impact and Strategies

Chair: **Marta Pérez Ibáñez**, Independent Scholar; TIAMSA-AMC\_PSB

**09:30 – 09:50**

**John Zarobell**, University of San Francisco, USA

*“Strategies of Collectivization: Art Market Alternatives from the Global South”*

**09:50 – 10:10**

**Annatina Aerne**, University of St. Gallen, Switzerland

*“The Double-Edged Sword of Prestige: A Network Analytic Approach to the Cooperation among Art Organizations in Bogotá’s Emerging Art Scene”*

**10:10 – 10:30**

**Linli Li**, School of Art and Design, Guangdong University of Technology, China

*“A Study on Art Funds in China: Features, Values, and Limits”*

**10:30 – 10:50**

**Vera Carmo**, Colégio das Artes da Universidade de Coimbra (UC) and Instituto Universitário da Maia (ISMAI), Portugal

*“Mola: Documenting Artist-Run Spaces”*

**10:50 – 11:10**

**Luís Urbano Afonso**, School of Arts of the University of Lisbon, Portugal

**Alexandra Fernandes**, ISCTE-IUL, Portugal  
**Loizos Petrides**, ISCTE-IUL, Portugal

*“The Reinvention of the Business Model of a Major Portuguese Auction House”*

**11:10 – 11:25**

**Discussion followed by Coffee Break**

**11:45 – 12:30 KEYNOTE ADDRESS**

**Ana Letícia Fialho**, HSE at Universidade Federal de São Paulo, Brazil

“Contemporary Art Markets in Latin America: Internationalization in Disequilibrium”

**12:30 – 12:45**

**Discussion**

**12:45 – 13:00 FAREWELL**

**Veronika Korbei**, TIAMSA

**Johannes Nathan**, TIAMSA; TU Berlin

**13:00 – 14:00**

**Lunch Break**

**14:00 – 15:30**

**TIAMSA Annual General Meeting**

**16:30 – 18:00**

**Special Event**

optional, registration required by 31 Oct, see [tinyurl.com/yyk57qwa](https://tinyurl.com/yyk57qwa)

**National Tile Museum**

Rua da Madre de Deus, 4, 1900-312 Lisboa

## Sunday 24 November

**Special Event**

optional, registration required by 10 Nov.

**Anozero - Coimbra Biennial of Contemporary Art** (Coimbra, Portugal)

Guided visit with the curators Agnaldo Farias and Lúcia Afonso

Transportation: by train (CP - Comboios de Portugal, 2h30) or by bus (Rede Expressos, 2h20)

see [tinyurl.com/y639tuss](https://tinyurl.com/y639tuss)

**Casa S. Roque - Centro de Arte** (Porto, Portugal)

The participants will be welcomed by collector Pedro Álvares Ribeiro, who is responsible for the Casa S. Roque, and who will be pleased to offer a Vintage Port Wine to the group.

Transportation: by train (CP - Comboios de Portugal, 3h) or by bus (Rede Expressos, 3h15)

see [tinyurl.com/y5mv93a5](https://tinyurl.com/y5mv93a5)

**Abstracts**

# *Keynote Speakers*

## How Contemporary Art Markets Are Made in the Global South

Olav Velthuis ▪ University of Amsterdam, Netherlands

---

Until the 1990s, markets for contemporary art were by and large non-existent in most regions in the world except for Europe and North America. Nowadays, many of these regions have flourishing art districts hosting scores of galleries; they host international art fairs; international auction houses scout these regions for new buyers, while private museums are being built by well-established collectors. This lecture will explain how these markets were constructed so rapidly in the global south. In doing so, it will go beyond often-heard economic explanations which see the emergence of these markets predominantly as a response to wealth creation and the rise of a class of super-rich in these regions. Instead, the lecture will focus on the evaluative and organizational work conducted by artists themselves, international curators and local cultural entrepreneurs. Empirically, the lecture will draw on both qualitative and quantitative data collected in a five-year, cross-comparative research project on the emergence of art markets in Brazil, Russia, India and China.

### Bio

Olav Velthuis is Professor at the Department of Sociology of the University of Amsterdam, specializing in economic sociology, sociology of the arts and cultural sociology. At the department, he is director of the program group Cultural Sociology; he used to be director of the MA programs in Sociology. His research interests include the globalization of art markets, the interrelations between market and gift exchange, the valuation and pricing of contemporary art, and the moral and socio-technological dimensions of markets for adult content. In a cross-comparative fashion, he has recently studied the emergence and development of art markets in the BRIC-countries (Brazil, Russia, India and China). The project was financed by a VIDI-grant from the Dutch Science Foundation (NWO). Before moving to the University of Amsterdam, he worked for several years as a Staff Reporter Globalization for the Dutch daily *de Volkskrant*. Also, he worked as an Assistant Professor at the University of Konstanz and as a Post-Doc at Columbia University.

Velthuis is the author of *Talking Prices. Symbolic Meanings of Prices on the Market for Contemporary Art* (Princeton University Press, 2005), which received the Viviana Zelizer Distinguished Book Award of the American Sociological Association for the best book in economic sociology (2006). The American magazine *Newsweek* referred to it as "the best study of what art spending means". He is also the author of *Imaginary Economics* (NAi Publishers, 2005), which was translated into Dutch and Italian. Together with Maria Lind of Tensta Konsthall (Stockholm), he edited the book *Contemporary Art and Its Commercial Markets A Report on Current Conditions and Future Scenarios* (Sternberg Press, 2012) and with Stefano Baia Curioni the book *Cosmopolitan Canvases. The Globalization of Markets for Contemporary Art* (Oxford University Press, 2015).

Apart from art markets, Velthuis has among others studied the market for literary fiction, cultural consumption and lifestyle, financial markets, and journalism. His academic work has appeared in leading journals in social science including *Theory & Society*, *Socio-Economic Review*, *Economy & Society*, *Journal of Consumer Culture*, *Journalism*, and the *Journal of Cultural Economics*. His journalistic writings have appeared in among others *Artforum*, the *Art Newspaper* and the *Financial Times*. His work has been cited in international media including *Newsweek*, *Die Zeit*, *Corriere della*

Sera, The Independent, Il Sole 24 Ore, the FreakonomicsBlog of the New York Times, and the Frankfurter Allgemeine Zeitung.

Velthuis has given keynote lectures and workshops at a variety of national and international cultural institutions including Tate Modern (London), Stedelijk Museum (Amsterdam), Toneelgroep Amsterdam, the International Committee for Museums and Collections of Modern Art (CIMAM), Tensta Konsthall (Stockholm), Art Basel, Rijksacademie (Amsterdam), Witte de With (Rotterdam), Christie's (London) and De Appel (Amsterdam).

He is president of The International Art Market Studies Association ([www.artmarketstudies.org](http://www.artmarketstudies.org)) and used to be board member of the Netherlands Foundation for Visual Arts, Design and Architecture (Fonds BKVB), which was the main government-sponsored foundation for visual artists in the Netherlands.

## Contemporary Art Markets in Latin America: Internationalization in Disequilibrium

---

Ana Letícia Fialho ■ Universidade Federal de São Paulo, Brazil

This paper investigates the connections and determinants related to the recent increase in the international visibility of contemporary art scenes in Latin America, the expansion and internationalization of its art markets, and their impact on the (re)writing of a “global art history”, or histories. When we examine recent developments in the contemporary art systems in Argentina, Brazil, Colombia and Chile, we find a disequilibrium in the process of internationalization of the art markets and in other aspects of their art systems, in particular the institutional and curatorial circuits. The imbalance between the art market and the institutional aspects of the art system in the region may be impacting on the way both contemporary art production itself and critical/curatorial reflections on that production circulate internationally. Despite the continuing impact of globalization and intense cultural interchange on contemporary art systems all around the world, shifting and reviewing mainstream narratives, increasing diversity and widening the geopolitical awareness of the contemporary art world, challenges persist when specific contexts are considered and in addressing the impact of the unspoken hierarchies.

### Bio

Ana Letícia Fialho manages programs and projects, lectures and researches in the arts and creative industries. She is currently a Visiting Lecturer on the postgraduate program in the History of Art at the Federal University of São Paulo, Brazil (UNIFESP). She completed her post-doctoral studies at the University of São Paulo, Brazilian Studies Institute in 2016. She has a Ph.D in the Sciences of Art and Language from the School of Advanced Studies in the Social Sciences (EHSS) in Paris, France (2006), a Master’s Degree in Cultural Management from the University of Lyon II, France (2006), and a LL.B. in Law from the Federal University of Rio Grande do Sul, Brazil (1997). Between 2016 and 2018, she was Director of the Department of Production Strategy at the Creative Industries Secretariat of the Ministry of Culture, Brazil. She was Executive Manager and Consultant for the Cinema do Brasil program from 2007 to 2019. She has been a Consultant on Market Intelligence and Research Coordinator for the Brazilian Association of Contemporary Art Galleries/Latitude Program since 2012 and was Executive Curator at the Fórum Permanente from 2007 to 2013. She has contributed to a number of publications, including *Sociologia das artes visuais no Brasil* (SENAC, 2012), *O valor da obra de arte* (Editor: Graca-Couto, Ronaldo, Metalivros, 2014); *Art et société : Recherches récentes et regards croisés, Brésil/France*. (Editor: Quemis, Alain: Villas Boas, Gláucia., 1ed.Marseille: OpenEdition Press, 2016). She was Joint Editor, with Leandro Valiati, of the *Atlas Econômico da Cultura Brasileira* (MINC/UFRGS, 2017), which was short-listed for the Jabuti Award in 2018.

**Abstracts**

# *Speakers*

# The Global South: The Local Markets and the Dynamics of the Global Art Market

## Leading Countries, the «Global South» and the Rest of the World: Reconsidering Categories through a Ranking of International Contemporary Art Galleries

Alain Quemin • Université Paris-8, France

Although globalization has become a common topic in the social sciences -especially from the 1990's- and is often taken for granted, we could show in some of our previous works that it seems more appropriate to talk in terms of *internationalization* than proper *globalization*. Today, in the contemporary art world and especially when it comes to the market, some poles clearly constitute the core of the activity, while some others are only peripheral or even non-significant as they are mostly excluded from the activity. We could show that, when it comes to the gallery segment of the art market, a limited number of countries that are all located in the Northern hemisphere and that are all Western play a central role. The US comes first, but a small number of European countries also have an important contribution: the UK, Germany, France, Switzerland and Italy. What about those countries that can be ranked under the common designation of “global South”? How much do they differ from the previous group and from the rest of the world? In order to evaluate the pertinence of the previous categories, we will rely on empirical data that we are presently developing in elaborating a *ranking* of the most important contemporary art galleries in the world. What does this ranking, considered under the angle of the various territorial groups that we mentioned previously, reveal about the structure and segmentation of the international art market? Our data will make it possible to test the various potential contours of the category “global South” (for instance, including or not the South of Europe or just countries located in the Southern hemisphere, and all of them or only some of them); but it will also enable us to better understand to what extent the galleries that are located in this “global South” are rather similar (or not) when it comes to the positions that they occupy on the international art market.

### Bio

Alain Quemin is an exceptional class professor of sociology of art at Université Paris-8 / Institut d'Études Européennes and an honorary member of Institut Universitaire de France. He holds a PhD from Ecole des Hautes Etudes en Sciences Sociales and an « habilitation à diriger des recherches » from Université Paris-3 Sorbonne nouvelle. He is an alumni of Ecole Normale Supérieure de Cachan and Institut d'Études Politiques de Paris. He is a past president of the sociology of art research committee of the International Sociological Association and was an invited professor in numerous universities worldwide (UCLA, Columbia University and the New School in the USA, Universität Zürich, Bologna University, Universitat de Barcelona, Moscow University...). Alain Quemin specializes in the sociology of art markets and institutions. He also studies visitors' surveys, the internationalization of the visual arts and the social construction of artistic reputations and consecration for visual artists. Among his recent books: *Les stars de l'art contemporain. Notoriété et consécration artistiques dans les arts visuels*, Paris, éditions du CNRS, 2013, 458 p. Alain Quemin also works as a journalist and art critic and is a regular contributor to *La Gazette Drouot*, *artpress* and *Le Journal des Arts*.

## No compass. Neither South nor North: Between Parintins and Phnom Penh

Alexandre Melo • ISCTE-IUL, Portugal

---

The crisis or the collapse of the idea of “centre” (and “artistic centre”), inseparable of the deepening process of “globalization” (and “cultural globalization”), implies a continuous questioning and critical re-organization of analytical notions, and the destabilization and plural reordering of the perspectives and ways of looking within the field of sociology (specially in sociology of art and culture).

Besides questioning the notion of “centre” and the criticism of traditional theories about the opposition between centre and periphery, it is the belief itself in the idea of “centrality” and the logic structure of binary oppositions generated by it (for instance between North and South or East and West), that has to be questioned in favour of aspiring to a particular gaze and demand which metaphorically, in the absence of “cardinal points”, I would call “no compass”.

In analytical terms we encounter problems like thinking about the status we should give objects and activities associated to traditional and ancestral cultural practices, characteristic of populations and areas of the globe until recently ignored or minimized by the “art world”.

The decentering of globalization generates a multiplication of global and globalizing points of view that come from situations that during a long time were seen as objects or victims of the process of globalization. We’re not talking about the emergence of new centres but the affirmation and multiplication of new voices and poles that speak, affirm, draw, define and practice their own globalizing perspective. This group of voices and practices can no longer be left out of the questioning within the art system.

I will try to equate problems like these from my reflections on concrete research conducted in places like Parintins and Phnom Penh.

### Bio

PhD and Master’s in Economics. Doctorate in Sociology. Professor of Sociology of Art and Culture (ISCTE-IUL), Curator and Art Critic.

Since the early 1980s he has written for publications such as "JL", "Expresso", "El País", "Flash Art" or "Parkett". He is a regular contributor to "Artforum".

He organized exhibitions in Portugal and abroad (10 Contemporary, Serralves; Eduardo Batarda, Gulbenkian, Venice Biennial - Julião Sarmiento, Biennial of São Paulo - Rui Chafes / Vera Mantero, etc.). Recent exhibitions: Liquid Skin - Apichatpong Weerasethakul / Joaquim Sapinho, MAAT; Roi Soleil - Albert Serra, Galeria Graça Brandão, Palácio Pombal).

He has authored Films/Documentaries on various artists and cultural programs for Television and Radio. He published books, among them *O Crítico Cúmplice*, *Arte e Poder na Era Global*, *Triunfo da Crise Económica*, *Sistema da Arte Contemporânea*, *Velocidades Contemporâneas*, *Aventuras no Mundo da Arte*, *Globalização Cultural*, *Arte e Mercado em Portugal*, *Arte e Artistas em Portugal*, *Julião Sarmiento* and *Arte Pop & Cia*.

## Analyzing the International Art Trade from the Global South Perspective

Joanna Bialynicka-Birula ▪ Department of Market Analysis and Marketing Research, Cracow University of Economics, Poland

The paper discusses the issue of international trade in art from the Global South perspective. Leaving aside the most important countries for the matter in question, i.e. the United States of America, some European countries (Great Britain, France, Germany, Switzerland) and China, attention is focused on the emerging economies of the southern hemisphere: South America, Africa, India, South-Eastern Asia.

The aim of the paper is to identify the value, directions, and indicators of the international art trade in the Global South countries. The analysis is based on the UN COMTRADE database and International Trade Center (ITC) statistics. Export and import of products classified to the commodity group 97 – works of art, collector's pieces and antiques – are analyzed.

An analysis of the economic value of the international art trade is presented. Special attention is given to trade balance indicators (negative or positive). Based on the data gathered, the directions of the international art trade in the selected Global South countries are identified. Furthermore, the issue of concentration of exporting countries and average distance with their destination countries and concentration of importing countries and average distance with their supplying countries are presented. The measure of concentration is based on the Herfindahl index (also known as the Herfindahl–Hirschman Index, HHI, or sometimes HHI-score). The average distance of supplying or importing countries corresponds to the average distance between the selected country and all its partner countries. The CEPII is the source of the data for the geographical distance between any two countries.

The paper also has a cognitive and empirical character. Advanced visualizations of results for geographical structures in the discussed regions are also presented in this contribution.

### Bio

Joanna Bialynicka-Birula holds a Ph.D. hab. (2017) - International Trade in the Works of Art in the European Community Countries. Gravity and Network Approach; a Ph.D. (2002) - Auctions as Instrument of Appraisal of Works of Art (awarded by Rector's Prize); and an M.A. (1995) - Auctions as the instrument of art appraisal in Poland, from Cracow University of Economics, Poland.

Her research activity comprises more than 60 publications in scientific papers, concerning mainly art market analysis, art value, art trade, international art trade, art market policy, art auctions, etc., and more than 20 statutory researches in the field of cultural economics. She was chair of the research project for the Ministry of Culture and National Heritage "Art Market in Poland" 2008, presenter at numerous domestic and international scientific conferences, and lecturer at International Cultural Center in Cracow, Poland (postgraduate studies) with a subject about Contemporary Art Market in Poland. She has nine Awards for Scientific Accomplishments (individual and group), and a Bronze Medal from the President of the Republic of Poland.

Member of TIAMSA.

## Contemporary Art, the Market, and the Global South

Idalina Conde • CIES/ISCTE-IUL, Portugal

Departing from a study on the recognition of contemporary art, e.g. issues, processes, mediations, and elites, now updated with a section with European and international scope, this paper combines two perspectives in which the main notion is that of value(s). Beyond floating and multidimensional meanings, the paper – newly formatted for this conference on the art market and the Global South – adopts a rather pragmatic outlook, at first to frame “value chains” as they operate on the ground. A mapping from the latest study for the European Commission on cultural and creative sectors, updating their cartography by the inclusion of digitization, provides an overall axis. Besides the pertinent chapter on the visual arts, the reference to the EU and Europe at large is relevant because of a section that pertains to the so-called Global South. But where is it in the international market for the contemporary art?

Here comes the second point of my perspective, an empirical appraisal not of the financial flows but of the position of the artists in some rankings, supposedly representative of geographies, reputational capital, and market value. Who rises to the vertex? It is, for example, the narrow elite of the first 150 positions (30%) in the “Top 500 contemporary artists”, as listed by artprice.com in its 2018 Report. In such an elite, the Global South is mainly represented by Asia (39.4%) with a Chinese monopoly (33.3%), in contrast to the tiny fraction for Latin America (2%) and others (Australia, South Africa, Iran: 2.7%). The USA takes a share of around 31%, and Europe 26%, although its Southern artists – stemming from countries like Spain, Italy, Romania, and adding France (with 2%) as a part of the country lies in the South Europe – only amount to 4.7%,. This share is significantly lower than Germany’s (10%) and that of the UK (8.7%). Complementary analyses show that the market elite consists of older artists (around 72% aged above 50 years) and that there are only few women (11) who are from different generations. Moreover, four of them have strong ties with the Global South: Beatriz Milhazes and Adriana Varejão are from Brazil, while the Chinese MI Qiaoming and the South African painter Marlene Dumas are currently only based in Amsterdam. Besides this elite, this presentation will scrutinize the selection to the 500 top artists – also using data from other sources, some of them from beyond the commercial market – in order to achieve a comparative view that includes examples from institutional and informal systems in the wide space of contemporary art. What are the distinctions, portraits, values and elites?

### Bio

Professor and researcher at CIES/ISCTE-IUL University Institute of Lisbon, currently preparing the academic aggregation. PhD in sociology with specialization on art and culture, parallel to biographical and memory approaches as well as visual studies. The PhD Thesis was about recognition and reception of contemporary art, from which is forthcoming the book *Recognition of Art: Issues, Mediations, Elites* (in Portuguese) with a section on the global stage. Other books in preparation that gather and update previous studies: *The Reception of Art and Cultural Literacy*; *Andy Warhol with Leonardo: From Monalisa to Christ*; *Il Cavallo de Leonardo: History, Imaginary and Legacy*. Author of numerous communications and publications, with regular attendance at national and international conferences, publishing about the art and cultural fields since late 80’s. Participant in European projects and co-founder in the 90’s of the ERICarts - The European Institute for Comparative Cultural

Research. Author, since 2006, of a research line on contemporary Europe with cultural and iconographic perspective. *Setting the Soul. Europe and Culture in Dialogue with Images*, also forthcoming as a book, was the project applied in 2017 for the "Altiero Spinelli Prize for Outreach: Spreading Knowledge about Europe" launched by the European Commission. Member of the Europeana Network Association.

## Comparing Internationalization Patterns Toward Emerging Markets for Contemporary Art: The cases of Art Basel in Miami and Hong Kong

Elisabetta Lazzaro ▪ HKU University of the Arts Utrecht, Netherlands

Nathalie Moureau ▪ Université Paul Valéry Montpellier 3, France

In the last two decades the most acclaimed fair worldwide, Art Basel, has carried out a unique international business strategy by opening two branches in Miami Beach (2002) and Hong Kong (2013), entering *de facto* two major emerging markets for contemporary art, namely Latin America and Asia-Pacific. What are the implications of this strategy at regional and local levels? Has it increased the visibility and created trade opportunities for artists and art galleries from these geographical areas, or does the commercial balance remain critically in favor of the Western established market? Also – as a counterbalance to a possible globalization – has this strategy boosted an artistic revitalization of the cities hosting the two fairs, especially toward less mainstream art? We address these questions by building a unique database and analyzing direct and indirect effects of the two markets' penetration at two points in time, 2015 and 2017. In particular, direct regional effects are measured by the relative national distributions of showcased art galleries and artists at the two fairs, and by the representative concentration of, respectively, Latin-American and Asian-Pacific artists. Indirect city effects are captured by the emergence of collateral events at city level catalyzed by the presence of the two fairs and possibly involving more local Latin-American and Asian-Pacific art. We finally compare the two realities to disentangle major idiosyncrasies of the two emerging markets.

### Bio's

Elisabetta Lazzaro (PhDs in Economics, Paris 1-Sorbonne and ULB) is Professor of Creative Economy at HKU University of the Arts Utrecht (Netherlands). Prof. Lazzaro's publications and teaching focus on the economics, management and policy of the arts, culture and creative industries (CCIs), including the art market, and smart valorization, innovation, growth and resilience through the CCIs. Prof. Lazzaro is Executive Board Member of the Association for Cultural Economics International (ACEI) and scientific advisor in several steering committees of major international and national organizations, governments and institutions.

Nathalie Moureau (PhD in Economics, Paris 1-Sorbonne) is Professor of Economics at the University Paul Valery Montpellier and Researcher at the ART-Dev (France). She is also Vice President of Culture at the same university. Specialized in cultural economics, Prof. Moureau has conducted researches for the Department of Studies, Forecasting and Statistics of the French Ministry of Culture. She has published several books and numerous articles on cultural economics, especially on the art market.

## Oasis in the Desert: Nigeria as an Evolving Hub of the African Contemporary Art Market

Jonathan Adeyemi • Queen's University Belfast, United Kingdom

---

The global art markets operate a centre-periphery structure and due to a richness of art market resources and infrastructures, it has been established that Western Europe and America constitute the twin core of the markets while other countries operate in the margins. However, growing art market resources and infrastructures outside these traditional centres, especially in Asia and Latin America, are gradually altering the scope of Euro-American hegemony. Discourses on African art markets had focused on South Africa, primarily because of the erroneous conceptualization of Africa as one single country, as well as the relative copiousness of art market infrastructures in South Africa – such as museums, galleries, annual art fairs, education and consistent dialogue in exhibition catalogues and journals. This study, through interviews and a review of the relevant literature, argues that despite missing government support for the arts in Nigeria, it is gradually evolving into a regional hub of African contemporary art market with its growing infrastructure. These include three auction houses, an art fair, two private museums (under construction), Lagos Biennial, galleries with an international focus, art residencies, artist-run-initiatives and consistent dialogues in journals and the art press. This transformation is largely spearheaded by returning emigrants from Europe and America who bring cultural, social and economic capital. The study also revealed a missing gap in respect of access, education and expertise, which are essential complements to the emerging infrastructures in Nigeria.

### Bio

Jonathan Adeyemi is a PhD Candidate in Arts Management and Cultural Policy, Queen's University Belfast, United Kingdom, with the project: "Trending in the Margins: Contemporary art of Nigeria in the global markets". He holds an MA in African Studies (Visual Arts), University of Ibadan, Nigeria (2011), an MBA from Ekiti State University, Nigeria (2008), and a BA (Hons) in Fine Arts, Ahmadu Bello University, Nigeria (1997).

## The Ljubljana Biennial of Graphic Arts and Its Socioeconomic Context: Capitalist vs. Socialist Art Markets

Petja Grafenauer ▪ Academy of Fine Arts, University of Ljubljana, Slovenia

Nataša Ivanović ▪ Academy of Fine Arts, University of Ljubljana, Slovenia

Andrej Srakar ▪ Institute for Economic Research (IER); Faculty of Economics, University of Ljubljana, Slovenia

The 'Global South' is a term in transnational and postcolonial studies describing what may also be called Developing World, developing countries, less developed countries and Non-Western world (Spivak, 1993; Braveboy-Wagner, 2003). In our contribution we use the example of the Ljubljana Biennial of Graphic Arts, the world's oldest existing biennial exhibition of contemporary graphic arts, founded in 1955, an event which from the start provided spaces for artists from different countries, long before this became a trend in contemporary art. Using comprehensive material from catalogues and publications since 1955, we construct a dataset of sales material to describe the history of the biennial and connect it to the turbulent events of from its foundation until today. As stated by Vidokle (2013: 4), "much of art production occurs in places without a market for art, or in countries where a capitalist market system is not the dominant form of social and cultural organization." With this in mind we particularly test the existence of differences between the determinants of art markets in capitalist and socialist systems, using hedonic regression with sample selectivity correction (Collins et al., 2007) to derive the appropriate (HPFCI) price index, and regressing the index in a cointegrating regression (see e.g. Wagner, 2018) to socioeconomic characteristics of the country under study. Finally, we compare the results of our study to the historical data on art markets of Western countries (McNulty, 2006) and a comparable modelling for Western art markets in the same period (1955-1991). The paper provides the first complete historical overview of a large art event in an ex-socialist country, connecting it to its larger context. It provides evidence for significant differences between the art markets in socialist and capitalist systems, using a semiparametric two-stage methodology to stir further research of art markets from a historical and comparative perspective.

### Bio's

Petja Grafenauer, PhD, is a curator, writer and Assistant Professor at the Department for Theory of the Academy of Fine Arts and Design, University of Ljubljana. She is a Doctor of Science and a specialist in the local and regional art created after World War II, primarily painting. Since 2012 she has been researching possible cross-sections of economy and art. Since 2017 she has run the Più Institute for Visual Art. In 2015–2017 she ran the Vodnik Homestead Gallery in Šiška, a non-profit organization. In 2016–2017 she was head of the Department for Photography at the Higher School of Applied Sciences (VIST), Ljubljana. In 2009–2015 she was co-editor of the Slovenian visual-arts magazine called Art Words. In 2005–2016 she lectured on the history of contemporary art at the Arts Academy of the University of Nova Gorica. In 2013–2014 she was curator at the Museum and Galleries of Ljubljana (MGML), working at the City Gallery of Ljubljana. In 2006–2009 she was a curator at the Ganes Pratt Gallery. In 2001–2008 she worked as a journalist for Radio Študent, and in 2005–2006 editor of its Section for Culture and Humanities.

Nataša Ivanović, PhD, graduated in Art History at the Faculty of Arts, University of Ljubljana, in 2007. In 2014, she finished her studies with a doctoral dissertation in Historical Anthropology at Alma Mater Europea, Institutum Studiorum Humanitatis in Ljubljana. Between 2008 and 2013 she was an assistant researcher at France Stele Institute of Art History, Scientific Research Centre of the Slovenian Academy of Sciences and Arts, Ljubljana. In 2013, she co-founded RI19+, where she continues with her research work, cooperates with art collectors, curates exhibitions and works as an assistant of History of Art at the Fine Art Academy, University of Ljubljana. During her doctoral studies, she spent various months abroad at the University of Vienna and INHA in Paris. Her research and scientific work focus on art between the 19th and 21st century, methodology of art history and anthropology of art. She held in recent past scientific lectures in Vienna, Leopold Museum (2018) and in Paris, Centre Georges Pompidou (2017) and curated exhibition Adrian Paci, Heritage of Displacement in TR3 Gallery in Ljubljana (2018).

Andrej Srakar, PhD (Economics), PhD Candidate (Mathematical Statistics), University of Ljubljana. Research Associate, Institute for Economic Research (IER) and Assistant Professor, Faculty of Economics, University of Ljubljana. Co-Editor, Review of Economics and Economic Methodology (REEM). Main research interests: cultural economics, management, policy and entrepreneurship, mathematical statistics, econometric theory, macroeconomics, economics of ageing. Author of first Slovenian monograph on cultural economics. Lead organiser of several international events in cultural economics in Slovenia. Fulbright Scholar at Indiana University Bloomington, USA (2011/12). Co-author of research reports for European Commission, European Parliament and EENC. Published in Journal of Cultural Economics, Cultural Trends, Journal of Cultural Heritage, Poetics, IJAM, Journal of Knowledge Management, European Planning Studies and Géographie et cultures. Lead author or coauthor of chapters for De Gruyter (2015), IGI Global (2017), Springer Verlag (2017), Edward Elgar (2018) and Routledge (2018; 2019). Co-editor of a special issue of Journal of Cultural Heritage (2018). Member of Scientific Programme Committee, 20th International Conference on Cultural Economics (ACEI), 2018. Past (2012-2016) chairman of Društvo Asociacija, largest Slovenian network of NGO's and freelancers in culture and the arts. Since May 2018, listed among the 15 best ranked Slovenian economists by total research output and exceptional achievements.

## Chinese Contemporary Export Art: 1989-2019

Iain Robertson • Sotheby's Institute of Art, London, United Kingdom

Chinese art from the period a decade after the reforms of Deng Xiaoping in 1979 and at the time of the China Avant Garde exhibition 1989 at the National Gallery of Art, Beijing, has been a story of foreign intervention into the Chinese cultural eco-system. The first showing of *shiyán meishu* (experimental art) at the China Avant Garde exhibition was a precursor to an avalanche of overseas (and Hong Kong) cultural ideologues, who set about transforming the cultural landscape of China.

This paper will recount from first-hand experience the processes and strategies that were set in motion by these phenomena. The commercial but also ideological motivations behind these foreign interventions have had a widespread, and I will argue, largely deleterious impact on Chinese contemporary art and Chinese cultural thinking.

The paper will look at a range of Chinese contemporary art forms that have been either wholly influenced or conceived according to international (Western) cultural norms, or else modified by Chinese to appear indigenous. The degree to which the Western commercial and cultural leaders have influenced a generation of luminaries of the Chinese art world and market is questionable, but on the surface at least, a generation of Chinese curators, critics, artists and collectors have been guided towards an international aesthetic narrative.

Consideration in this presentation will also be given to the synchronization of symbolic and commercial value in the early days of the China market and its initial acceptance on the international stage. The latent, in many cases, or haphazard aesthetic validation of this new art is a blueprint for all art from new markets. The pattern of critical and market evolution is not so much a model as a study in pragmatism, and it has been adopted by other new markets since.

The roots of the success of the China market have many strands; macro-economic, in particular regional economic vitality, a rich cultural history, a distinct and separate cultural tradition and a long-standing abiding international interest in all things China. But ultimately, initial inward cultural and economic investments appear to have set in motion a powerful force that may not have been as effective without foreign intervention from the beginning.

### Bio

PhD, MA and BA (Hons), City University, London.

Dr Iain Robertson is Head of Art Business Studies at Sotheby's Institute of Art. He was Exhibitions Officer, Royal Institute of British Architects; Cultural Officer, British Mission to Taiwan and Senior Lecturer in Arts Policy & Management at City University.

His books include: *Understanding International Art Markets and Management* (2005); *The Art Business* (2008); 'A New Art from Emerging Markets' (2011); *Understanding Art Markets, Inside the World of Art and Business* (2016); *Art Business Today: 20 Key Topics* (2016). Two forthcoming texts: 'New art New Markets' and 'Our Culture' will appear in 2017 and 2018 respectively. He was art market editor of Art Market Report and is co-series editor of *Handbooks in Art Business* (SIA and Lund Humphries). He has written over one hundred articles in the arts and national press. He consults for banks in Asia and Europe and is visiting professor to Tsinghua and Lisbon Universities.

## Network and Structure: Mapping the Museum Valorization in Chinese Emerging Contemporary Art

Simeng Chang ▪ Erasmus University Rotterdam, Netherlands; Burgundy School of Business, France

This paper aims to study the structure of museum valorization in the emerging Chinese contemporary art by using museum exhibition data. Adopting Becker's world theory (1982) and Bourdieu's field theory (1993), this article demonstrates a dual and complementary perspective in mapping the scene of museum valorization. Following Becker's approach, the scene of museum valorization is conceptualized as a symbolic network where artistic recognition flows from museum to artist through exhibitions. As the interactions between museums and artists are the externalization of objective relations according to Bourdieu's field theory, the mapping of the relational position of artists in the exhibition network and different forms of capital (economic, cultural, social and political capital) accumulated by individual artists contributes to reveal the structure of museum valorization for the emerging Chinese contemporary artists.

Employing social network analysis (SNA) and multiple correspondence analyses (MCA) on the museum exhibition records of 547 Chinese contemporary artists born after 1976, we map the relational positions of different capitals in the space of museum valorization in the period of 1989-2015. The results show that artist network position varies according to the types and amounts of economic, social and cultural capital. More specifically, core artists contrast most from semi-periphery artists by the form of cultural capital. Artists in the core position of the museum exhibition network are more likely to practice traditional art and graduate from top academies. However, semi-periphery and periphery artists are not distinguishable by the form of cultural capital. In terms of the economic capital, core artists stand out from the rest by gallery representation and the level of average auction prices. Last but not least, social capital differs between artists in the semi-periphery position and those from the periphery. The fact that semi-periphery artists are more likely to work with independent curators shows the important role of independent curators in lifting young talents.

### Bio

Simeng Chang holds a master's degree of Cultural Economics & Cultural Entrepreneurship from Erasmus University Rotterdam. She is currently a lecturer and master coordinator in Burgundy School of Business (BSB), as well as a researcher in Arts and Cultural Management Research Center in BSB. She is a PhD candidate of Erasmus School of History, Culture and Communication in Erasmus University Rotterdam. Her PhD research focuses on Chinese contemporary art, with a special aim of building a network concept and applying network analysis on understanding the structure of museum and art fair and the mechanism of auction price.

## Art as Alchemy: Reframing the 'Work' of Art in the Global South

---

David Challis ▪ Melbourne University, Australia

In November 1920 Jacques Seligmann explained the surprising demand from European art collectors in the otherwise devastated post-war French economy by noting that it was 'wise of them to exchange their depreciated currency against works of art which have a world value'. This is an early reference to one of art's defining characteristics in the economic sphere, that of a portable real asset, which, like gold, makes it an effective hedge against inflation and currency devaluation. This paper proposes that – because the highly leveraged and export focused economies of the global south are more susceptible to economic instability – the importance of art's 'work' as a hedge against inflation and currency devaluation is more apparent and highly valued. Two case studies are considered. The first investigates the extent to which Asian art collectors are incentivized to assemble collections of 'blue chip' artworks that can be monetized into a more stable currency in the event of local economic disruption. The second case study examines the growing market for contemporary art across Asia and whether its attractiveness as an export commodity influences its production. The case studies give an insight into the impact of art's 'world value' on the supply and demand dynamic of the Asian art market and the additional 'work' performed by art in a global south context. In doing this, the paper contributes to discussions around the persistence, contribution and specificity of art markets in the global south relative to the dynamics of the global art market.

### Bio

David Challis is a PhD graduate in the Art History School at Melbourne University in Melbourne, Australia. His thesis examined the socio-economic context and art historical consequences of the interwar translocation of French modernist art. He is the author of a recently published article 'Rodin's sculpture in Japan and the Economics of Translocation' in the *Journal for Art Market Studies* and has contributed a chapter titled 'Moving Mountains: Paris-based Dealers and the Economics of Translocation,' to the forthcoming edited book *Pioneers of the Global Art Market: Paris-based dealers and networks, 1850 – 1950*. David returned to full time study at Melbourne University in 2013 after a successful twenty-three year career in the Financial Markets Industry based in Australia and London.

# The Collecting Process. Models, New Collectors and New Private Museums

## Asian Art Collectors and Their Role in Markets of Contemporary Art

---

Melanie Fasche ▪ Sotheby's Institute of Art, London, United Kingdom

This paper focuses on art collectors in Asia and their role in markets of contemporary art. After tracing the expansion of the practice of collecting contemporary art in Asia in recent years, the paper aims at shedding light on who these new collectors are, which motivations they are following, what they are collecting, and how their collecting practices may deviate from conventional collecting practices. Furthermore, the paper will discuss the role of these collectors in both regional and global art markets of contemporary art. The findings will be exemplified by select examples.

### Bio

Melanie Fasche is an Economic Geographer who recently joined the Sotheby's Institute of Art in London as a Lecturer in the MA in Art Business and Semester Programme Art and Business. Her research focuses on the contemporary art market, cities and their economies with central questions around the creation of value. Previously Melanie held positions as Contractually Limited Assistant Professor at the Department of Geography at the University of Bayreuth, and as Postdoctoral Fellow at the Rotman School of Management at the University of Toronto. She received a PhD in Urban and Regional Economics from HafenCity University Hamburg.

## Philanthropists and Patrons – A New Future for the Indian Contemporary Art Market

Georgina Bexon • Royal Society of Arts and Royal Asiatic Society, United Kingdom

The marriage of art and philanthropy has experienced a long and steady history in India; from the early kings through the Rajput, Deccan and Mughal dynasties to the philanthropist industrialists of the 19<sup>th</sup> and 20<sup>th</sup> centuries. However, in the last decade new models of patronage and philanthropy have started to take form, intent on creating not the traditional private, but new public, platforms for contemporary art. These new patrons can be viewed as ‘positive disruptors’ – actively compensating for the dearth of infrastructure which includes a lack of state support, few public spaces and museums, and little public critical and curatorial dialogue.

Philanthropic art initiatives have increased significantly; the number of art projects and foundations has more than doubled since 2008. Recent non-commercial art initiatives have included the opening of private museums and art centres in Delhi, Mumbai, Bangalore and Kolkata and artist-led festivals such as the Kochi-Muziris Biennale and the Chennai Photo Biennale. Recent research shows that India is the world’s fastest growing producer of wealth, so we can assume that this encouraging trend is likely to continue and expand.

This growing exposure for, and public engagement with, contemporary art is consequently impacting the nascent art market for contemporary Indian art, encouraging a new breed of buyer whose tastes, behaviour and motivations are quite different to those historically evidenced in the art world.

This paper considers this artistic and economic development through the lens of the French economic sociologist Lucien Karpik’s concept of ‘singularities’ (high quality, unique goods) and the judgement devices inherent in their market, particularly his ‘regime of expert-opinion’. Subsequently it examines the closely associated role of the new philanthropists and patrons, tracking the important networks of influence that connect their new enterprises to the art market for contemporary Indian art.

### Bio

Georgina is an art historian, lecturer and writer specializing in South Asian modern and contemporary art who has lived and worked in the UK, USA and Singapore. She holds 3 degrees: BA Art History, Southampton University, MA Arts Management, City University of London and MA Contemporary Art, SOAS, University of London. Georgina has been a visiting lecturer at Brighton and Sussex universities and currently presents talks at leading art institutions including Christie’s Education New York and the Museum of Modern Art Moscow. She is a member of the Art Historians Association and a Fellow of the Royal Society of Arts and the Royal Asiatic Society in the UK. Her practice includes collecting and consulting and she has developed a network of gallery and artist connections in Europe, the USA and India, which she visits regularly.

## Perspectives of Contemporary Art Collecting in Brazil

Nei Vargas da Rosa ▪ Federal University of Rio Grande do Sul, Brazil

The theme of this contribution is the research project *Perspectives of Contemporary Art Collecting in Brazil*, carried out between 2018 and 2019. In order to conduct this study, the first of its kind in the country, the adopted methodology focusing mainly on surveying data on the performance of primary market collectors. A questionnaire with 45 questions was created in collaboration with an interdisciplinary group and sent to the target audience by email. Additionally, *in situ* interviews were conducted with collectors in 16 Brazilian states, revealing a widely assorted and potent universe of agents who manage private collections of multiple magnitudes and comprehensiveness.

The research received contributions from experts in Statistics, Art History, Sociology, Law, Anthropology, and Psychology, among others. References were made to the Platform *Latitude*, a partnership between ABACT and the Brazilian Trade and Investment Promotion Agency (APEX-BRAZIL); the *Collecting in the Digital Age International Collectors Survey* by AXA ART with 914 world collectors; and *Collectionneurs D'art Contemporain: des acteurs méconnus de la vie artistique*, sponsored by the Department of Surveys, Forecasts, and Statistics (DEPS) of the French Ministry of Culture.

The results of this study offer an understanding of the profile, scale, operation, values, administration, and development of contemporary art collecting, the interrelations between agents and their private setting, with cultural institutions, governments and the impact of their public policy instruments in the arts medium, as well as notions and valuations involved in the collecting process. The data can aid in grasping the meanings of this practice and its relationship with the writing of History of Art, along with its economic progression in the cultural field. Funding for this project came from the Institute of Contemporary Culture (Instituto de Cultura Contemporânea), a private institution which sponsors research on contemporary art and culture in São Paulo.

### Bio

Nei Vargas da Rosa is doctoral student of Visual Arts, emphasis in History, Theory and Criticism of Art at the Federal University of Rio Grande do Sul researching the institutionalization of private collections of contemporary art in Brazil. With master's degree in the same University, his dissertation "Emerging structures of the art system: cultural banking institutions, producers and curators" was awarded at the Public Notice Brazil Contemporary Art: Economy of Art, by Bienal of São Paulo Foundation.

Currently, as a doctoral student, he organized the Art System in Contemporaneity Dossier to Federal University of Uberlândia, he is a member of the Organizing Committee of the *Art beyond art - International Symposium on Art Systemic Relations*, which will have a second edition in São Paulo next July. He also coordinator of the research project *Perspectives of Contemporary Art Collecting in Brazil* and *Dynamics of Contemporary Art Collection - Cycle of debates*, both sponsored by the Institute of Contemporary Culture of São Paulo.

He is associated in The International Art Market Studies Association by subcommittee Art Market and Collecting: Portugal, Spain and Brazil.

## The Fantastic Voyage: The History of Collecting from Pre-Modern Assyria until Contemporaneity in Six Typologies (Psychologists and Sociologists Please Abstain!)

---

Paco Barragán ▪ University of Salamanca, Spain

To affirm that collectors throughout history have had a bad reputation is a mere understatement. I would state that their reputation is simply awful! It's difficult not to come to that conclusion while researching the available bibliography. 'Possessive' said the French Doctor Louis La Caze (1890); 'speculative' argued the sociologist Raymonde Moulin (1967); 'hoarder' wrote the American psychiatrist Frederick Baekeland (1981); for the Polish philosopher Krystof Pomian (1990) we are dealing with a 'socialité'; the British museologist Susan Pearce places them in the category of 'fetishists'; the British anthropologist Anthony Sheldon (2001) frames them as a 'trophy-hunters'; the financial advisor and former President of Christie's New York Doug Woodham (2017) dubbed them 'competitors' – and we better stay clear from the illustrious sociologizing and psychologizing theories of Sigmund Freud, Pierre Bourdieu, Baudrillard *et al.*

Ever wondered why collectors have such a bad reputation, both inside and outside the field? I do not have the answer to this thought-provoking question. And to be honest: it's of little or no interest to me!

I suggest instead the articulation of a set of typologies that allow us to construct a historical framework of collecting through its main actors. Six typologies that traverse the history of collecting and humanity from Pre-modern Assyria till Contemporaneity: *the warrior* (Ashurbanipal), *the philanthropist* (Pericles), *the maecenas* (Gaius Cilnius Maecenas), *the connoisseur* (Isabella d'Este), *the aficionado* (Luis Alberto Ferré), and *the cosmopolite* (Baroness Carmen 'Tita' Thyssen-Bornemisza). Every typology is represented through a concrete historical character, its architectural taxonomy, the prevailing ideology, and its chronology.

I propose a historically articulated framework by providing a set of neutral and contextualizing typologies that codify collecting in the Global South, but also serve as a global model for this complex and fascinating passion.

The 21<sup>st</sup> century needs new perspectives.

No more moralizing, please!

### Bio

Paco Barragán is a Spanish arts writer and curator. He is Contributing Editor of the American magazine *Artpulse* and a PhD candidate at the University of Salamanca, Spain.

Between 2015 and 2017 he was the Head of the Visual Arts Department of the Cultural Arts Centre Matucana 100 in Santiago de Chile.

He has curated 81 international exhibitions between 2002 and 2019. Some of the exhibitions he has curated are *This is What Life is About. Narratives of Progress, Freedom, and Self-Fulfillment in*

*Today's Capitalism* at Domus Artium (DA2), Salamanca, Spain; *¡Patria o Libertad! On Patriotism, Nationalism and Populism* at MoCCA in Toronto, Canada; and *The End of History and the Return of History Painting* at the Museum voor Moderne Kunst in Arnhem, The Netherlands.

Paco Barragán is author of *The Art to Come* (2002), published by Subastas Siglo XXI, Madrid; *The Art Fair Age* (2008) published by CHARTA, Milan; and co-editor of *When a Painting Moves...Something Must be Rotten* (2011). His essay "Neo-modernity, Neo-biennialism, Neo-fairism" was included in Titia Hulst (ed.), *A History of the Western Art Market: A Sourcebook of Writings on Artists, Dealers, and Markets* (2017) published by UCLA Press.

### Shifts in Consecration Power of and for African Players in Global Art Play

Michael Hutter • Institute of Sociology, Technische Universität Berlin, Germany; Berlin Social Science Center (WZB)

In the “visual art system”, players attempt to gain credit for the aesthetic value of series of singular works. Value attribution, or consecration, moves formerly unknown works and artists to prominence, and a few works per time period to canonical status. The power to consecrate shifts among players, and it is constrained by the properties of the works to be valued. Are there indications for a shift toward the Global South?

The visual art game has evolved over the past four centuries. To better perceive the secular dimensions of its change, a comparison of historical figurations of players is suggested. Part 1 reports on the figuration in Paris, Europe’s major cultural cluster at the time, as it is documented for the period 1730-1760. Rich and mostly noble amateurs collected the works of already known artists, researched authorship attributions and supported contemporary artists. The first international merchants established themselves, and auction catalogues became a medium of value attribution and assessment. Part 2 looks at activities of major contemporary art game participants, with an exemplary focus on African engagement. The yearly circuit of relevant events around the globe is visited with increasing frequency by collectors and curators who reside in cultural centers of the Global South. Gallerists and curators from the Global South have found ways to integrate the symbolic vocabulary of artists from non-Western cultural contexts into the taste categories valued in the global art game.

Despite the proliferation of new players – artists, curators, gallerists, museum directors, collectors and writers –, the basic configuration of player types has remained rather stable over the centuries. On playgrounds that link spaces, events and sales, value attribution is still dominated by a few prestigious amateur collectors, gallerists and curators. The range of local and regional games has proliferated, which has elevated the level of acclaimed or paid value for those series of artworks that circulate in the topmost game.

#### Bio

Professor emeritus since 2015. Director of the research unit “Cultural Sources of Newness” at Berlin Social Science Center (WZB) and Research Professor at the Institute of Sociology, Technische Universität Berlin, 2008-14. Getty Research Institute fellow 2003/4 and 2007. Chair for Theory of the Economy and its Social Environment at Witten/Herdecke University, 1987-2007. B.A. Economics (Portland State University), 1970; M.A. Economics (Univ. of Washington/Seattle), 1971; Dr. rer. pol. (Ludwig-Maximilians-Universität, Munich), 1976.

Recent publications: “The Rise of the Joyful Economy. Artistic Innovation and Economic Growth from Brunelleschi to Murakami” (Routledge, 2015), “Moments of Valuation. Exploring Sites of Dissonance” (edited with A. Berthoin Antal and David Stark, Oxford U. Press, 2015), “Sourcing newness: ways of inducing indeterminacy” (with Ignacio Farías), in: *Journal of Cultural Economy* 10.5, 2017: 434-449.

## A Dealer's Work: Creating Value, Creating Narratives

Olga Sooudi ▪ Department of Anthropology, University of Amsterdam, Netherlands

This paper explores how an art dealer creates value for works in an emerging art market context. Specifically, it looks at how value—monetary, aesthetic, and art historical—is created for works in a situation where the dealer is confronted with multiple types of uncertainty that he must manage, negotiate, and sometimes resolve in order to create value and execute a sale. Empirically, I focus on one ethnographic case study of a secondary market sale of a collection of artworks at a private art gallery in Mumbai, India. The data, collected in 2017-2018, follow the artworks as they move from the seller to the dealer and their gallery and finally to the buyer. Here I examine the dealer's labor in the value-creation process, including obtaining the works; curating an exhibition around them; finding buyers; and executing a sale. Conceptually, I consider three processes. First, value creation involves the creation of multiple narratives within which the works can be read, identified, and situated by certain audiences, including buyers. Second, while initially appearing to be a linear, straightforward process, value creation is fuzzy and unpredictable, and the dealer must constantly recalibrate their actions and assessment of the works' value based upon new information and conditions. Third, I treat the dealer as a kind of broker figure, i.e. an actor who stands to profit from the mediation of valued resources across different social worlds and/or regimes of value. Brokers become especially important and visible during periods of rapid change, such as during the development and globalization of new markets. Drawing upon the anthropology of brokerage, I will explore how the art dealer-as-broker may play a key role in not only mediating art, but as an agent creating new categories, markets, and meanings for Indian art.

### Bio

Olga Sooudi is an Assistant Professor in Anthropology at the University of Amsterdam, since 2014. Previously, she was a Postdoctoral Researcher at the Amsterdam Centre for Globalization Studies in 2011-2013. She obtained her MPhil and PhD in Anthropology from Yale University.

Her research and publications have focused broadly in two areas: art worlds and the art market, with a focus on South Asia; and, based in her earlier research, on artists, cultural translation, and artist migration, with a focus on Japan. Her first book, based on her PhD research, *Japanese New York: Migrant artists and self-reinvention on the world stage* (University of Hawai'i Press, 2014) is an ethnographic study of Japanese artist migration to New York City and back to Japan. It explores how artistic vocation and migration intertwine as a technique of self-reinvention for artists.

Since late 2011, she has been conducting ethnographic research in India on the art world and market, primarily in Mumbai. Two of her key publications from this ongoing research are: (2018) "Market Memories: Collective memory and art market change in Mumbai", *Poetics*, 71: 83-94; and (2016) "Making Mumbai's Emerging Art World Through Makeshift Practices", *South Asia: Journal of South Asian Studies*, 39(1): 149-166.

## Clara Diament Sujo: Dealing with 'Art of the Americas' in Venezuela and the US

Ana Avelar ▪ University of Brasília, Brazil

---

This paper addresses the work and ideas of Clara Diament Sujo, Argentine art dealer and critic, who had an important role consolidating the art market in Venezuela during the second half of the 20th Century while also promoting Latin American Art in the United States. In her galleries, Estudio Actual in Caracas, and CDS in New York, Sujo showed Latin American artists whose work gesture constituted a relevant dimension – Alejandro Reverón, Roberto Matta, Wifredo Lam, among others. I aim to discuss the Latin American Art outlook that interested Sujo, and to understand her interest particularly in Abstract Expressionism and Lyrical Abstraction. As is well known, Sujo held the belief that the term “Art of the Americas” was more adequate than “Latin American Art” as a way to minimize the stigma she saw associated with this production while also wishing to eliminate the differences between the apprehension of North and South art. Therefore, her shows mixed contemporary and modern artists from both the Americas and Europe, including referential avant-garde names. Researching Clara Diament Sujo’s role in North American and Latin American art markets aims at better understanding the circulation of her vision regarding American artists in general. This contribution results from a project accepted by the Getty Research Institute which aims at understanding Sujo’s role in the art market, specially concerning her interest for Lyrical Abstraction and Abstract Expressionism.

### Bio

Ana Avelar is Adjunct Professor of Theory, Art Criticism and History of Art at University of Brasília (UnB), Brazil. She has written several papers on Informalism and Lyrical Abstraction in Brazil and the book *A Raiz Emocional* [The Emotional Root] about Brazilian contemporary art critic Lourival Gomes Machado, whose work regarded mostly abstract art. As a curator, she has recently presented group and solo shows at the Museum of Contemporary Art of The University of São Paulo (MAC/USP) and at Niemeyer House, in Brasília, where she also coordinates the OCA Artistic Residency at Casa da Cultura da América Latina [House of Latin American Culture] (CAL/ UnB). She has also been a member of selection committees for Rumos Itaú Cultural and Pipa awards for the Visual Arts. In 2017, she was a finalist for the Marcantonio Vilaça Prize in curating, and, in 2018, she was selected for the program Curator Exchange 2018/2019, offered by Latitude - Platform for Brazilian Art Galleries Abroad and The Getty Research Institute.

## Placing Art in the Global Art Market: Status, Practices and Networks of Brazilian Art Galleries in a Transnational Cultural Field

Amanda Brandellero ▪ Department of Arts and Culture Studies, Erasmus University, Rotterdam, Netherlands

This paper explores the way art gallerists and artists from Brazil – a market considered ‘emergent’ – position themselves globally. It examines how the globalization of markets is experienced and practiced by “peripheral” agents, by focusing on how Brazilian contemporary art is placed in the global art market, and how this structures the institutional logics and market dynamics locally. The contribution shows how international status differentials between Brazilian art galleries and artists reflect and determine practices. The data analysis is based on a combination of cluster analysis of secondary data of Brazilian art galleries’ national and international art fair participation from 2000-2013, and qualitative interviews (37 gallerists and 15 artists), and participant observation in São Paulo and Rio de Janeiro. It shows how art galleries and artists adopt global practices locally, and engage in networks transnationally to achieve status gains abroad and at home. It also highlights how the market has consolidated both locally and internationally around three art gallery status positions: the high end internationally oriented, the second-tier national and internationally oriented, and the exclusively national. Globalization destabilizes the local field, but also brings new elements of stability in the form of global conventions, working practices, and valorization scripts. I identify three repertoires that describe art market status positions of galleries along the local/global continuum: *being local* – that is understanding one’s role and position as essentially serving a market which is geographically bound by the city or nation; *being global locally* – that is adopting the ‘rules’ of the global art market, showcasing foreign artists, or producing art which corresponds to global aesthetics; *going global* – by strengthening global social networks, by accessing art fairs and institutions abroad.

### Bio

Amanda Brandellero is Assistant Professor at the Department of Arts and Culture Studies, at the Erasmus University in Rotterdam. With a background in economic geography and cultural sociology, her research explores how cultural production, consumption and cultural heritage in urban settings are shaped by cultural globalisation. Her research has taken a comparative approach, with case studies in different contemporary European settings and Brazil; she has also researched different cultural and creative industries, including crafts, popular music and contemporary art.

## Singapore and the Construction of a Southeast Asian Art Market

---

Jérémie Molho ▪ Robert Schuman Centre for Advanced Studies, European University Institute, Florence, Italy

What role do cities play in the emergence of new regional art markets? The increasing interest towards art markets in the global South goes along with regional segmentations. It is now common to talk about the “African art market”, the “Asian art market” or the “Middle Eastern art market”. The goal of this presentation is to analyze how urban art market ecosystems manufacture such macro representations. I draw on fieldwork conducted in Singapore in 2015 and 2018, where I conducted over 40 interviews with key players of the art market, including gallery directors, art fair managers, museum administrators, policymakers and artists. In this presentation I intend to explain the role played by these different actors in positioning Singapore as a hub for the Southeast Asian art market, in the context of a rising global interest for the Asian art market driven from the 2000s by the sudden rise of the Indian and especially of the Chinese market. I will stress the challenges that the Singaporean art market actors face due to the fragmentation of the Southeast Asian art market into separate national scenes. I will explain the strategies they develop in order to create various networks to construct a Southeast Asian art scene in both symbolical and material terms.

### Bio

Jérémie Molho is research associate at the cultural pluralism research area of the global governance program, at the Robert Schuman Centre for Advanced Studies of the European University Institute in Florence. As of October 2019, he is research fellow at the Asia Research Institute of the National University of Singapore. He received a BA in Middle Eastern studies and a MA in urban studies from Sciences Po Paris and completed his PhD in geography in 2016 at the University of Angers. His dissertation analyzed the emergence of cities as new centres of the global art market. He conducted fieldwork in Istanbul, Singapore and Hong Kong. Since then he has pursued his endeavor in developing a geographic approach to the study of the global art market, by conducting more fieldwork in Singapore, as well as in Doha, Qatar.

## Global [South] Ambition: The Role of Art Auctions in the Strategic Positioning of Singapore and 'Southeast Asian Art'

Anita Archer • Melbourne University, Australia

---

The Singapore government has strived for decades to position the island state as a central hub for regional and international art activity and transactions with successive cultural policies including 'Global Cities for the Arts' (1992), 'Renaissance City' (2000) and the Economic Strategies Committee reclamation of Gillman Barracks in 2010 to form "an arts and creative cluster". Economic impetus has been the underlying motivator for many of the government's cultural initiatives, including the Singapore Freeport that opened in 2010 with the explicit purpose of attracting "high net worth art collectors" and "key players in the art business". In his analysis of global art markets, Hans Belting asserts that "auction houses, with their new branches, are the most important agent of the global turn". In the light of Belting's claim, this paper seeks to interrogate auction house activity in Singapore, whilst simultaneously considering the auction sale category 'Southeast Asian art' more broadly. It examines the participation of the multinational auction houses, Sotheby's and Christie's, alongside the branch extensions of regional auction houses, particularly from Indonesia and Malaysia, in order to understand the role that auction houses play in the global ambitions of Singapore. Furthermore, this paper reveals the key players in this market and thereby examines the network of influence that underpins the symbolic and economic value of art offered at auction from this region. This analysis will attempt to determine whether the specificities of such a diverse range of local 'Southeast Asian' markets can be successfully integrated into a regional auction market hub.

### Bio

Dr Anita Archer is an art historian whose research focus is global art markets. Her PhD research examined the role of international auction houses in expanding a market for Chinese Contemporary Art in the West. Anita completed an honours degree in Art History at University of Leicester and went on to study and train with Sotheby's in London. She is also an independent art consultant and auctioneer based in Melbourne, Australia. Her consultancy specialises in Australian, Indigenous and Asian Contemporary Art and for the past twenty years, Anita has advised Australian and international collectors on the acquisition and sale of art. Additionally, through the platform of Pegasos5, Anita has facilitated the participation and engagement of Asian artists into multiple Australian and international art events and festivals. She was the first female auctioneer in Western Australia and has spent many years as an independent auctioneer, leading sales in Australia, Jakarta, Singapore and Hong Kong. Anita is Research Coordinator for the 'Enlightenment, Romanticism and Contemporary Cultures (ERCC)' Research Unit at the University of Melbourne and is author of the recently published article Genesis of an auction sale category: Sotheby's inaugural auction of 'Contemporary Chinese Art' in the Journal for Art Market Studies.

## How Validation Patterns Have Limited South-Centricity in the Contemporary African Art Ecology

Mary Corrigan • Independent Scholar, South Africa

---

Drawing from my recent study and publication, *Contemporary African Art Ecology: A Decade of Curating* (2018), my presentation will explore the limits bearing down on a 'South-centric' art ecosystem through the analysis of the curatorial practices of Africa's most high profile curators over a decade long period (2007 to 2017). Curators serve as the lens due to their vital role in establishing visibility of, and justification for a category of art from Africa dubbed 'contemporary'. As this study reveals, this drive naturally saw them gravitate towards western art centers – or, it is in these hubs that their motivation is solidified. This gravitational pull towards western art centers is further echoed through patterns pertaining to commercial activity in African art centers. Indeed, the growth and structure of the ecosystem pertaining to contemporary African art remains tethered to Western ones due to the fact that ultimate validation (institutional and market related) is best accrued in these hubs. Through a presentation of the hard data and analysis pertaining to the curatorial practices of the elite group of African curators identified in 'Contemporary African Art Ecology: A Decade of Curating', this paper will advance the notion that a drive for institutional and market validation has to some degree suffocated the emergence of 'South-centric' art ecosystem(s). This assertion is balanced against the patterns of curating pertaining to another group of curators (less high profile, but as active), shifts in the ecosystem that offer possibilities for South-centric 'validation' and future curatorial patterns that appear to be designed to advance this. As such it becomes clear that African curators are driven to resist Western/Northern centrality, though often they are forced to mount it in these centers, affirming its centrality in the global art ecosystem.

### Bio

In 2017 Mary Corrigan established a Cape Town-based art research consultancy with a focus on mapping developments in contemporary art from the African continent and translating findings into reports that could be accessible to academics, industry specialists, artists and the public. As such advancing greater transparency and increasing knowledge. The consultancy relies on a network of art specialists in major African art capitals. Their publications are a unique mix of journalistic, academic traditions combined with new technologies and approaches borne from the age of information and data mining.

In her capacity as a journalist and academic Corrigan has been closely observing and commentating on the contemporary African art for over 15 years. Following a decade as an art critic at *The Sunday Independent*, she has been a regular contributor to numerous African based publications including *The Times*, *The Sunday Times*, *Mail & Guardian*, *Businessday* and *Financial Mail*. CNN, the European Commission, the English Academy of South Africa, the Arts & Culture Trust among other authorities have all awarded her arts journalism.

She carved out a reputation in academia as a Research Fellow at The Research Centre for Visual Identities in Art and Design at the University of Johannesburg from 2009 until 2015. In this role she presented numerous papers centred on her interest in the 'contemporary' rubric as applied to African art and the role of dress and performance in artistic practices in South Africa.

## Is the Art Market Biased? Women Artists in the Spanish Art Market

---

Carolina Rodvalho ▪ Independent Scholar, Spain

This paper addresses the current situation of the Spanish women artists in the art market. Understanding the art market as an activity of selling and buying artistic goods, we ask ourselves if the gender of an artist intervenes in the selling process of an art piece, constituting one more factor to take in account when pricing a good. If so, we want to analyze if the gender affects different art markets in the same way.

Does the sex of the creator affect the final price of his oeuvre? To find the answer, we focus on the primary art market and analyze the variables that clearly affects the artist's prices with the purpose to discover if the gender affects directly or indirectly the final price of an art piece. To do so, we rely on the opinion and the personal experience of different market agents as collectors, gallerists and artists, bringing a new approach to the subject that aims to shed light on the relation between gender and the art market in Spain.

Women are under a glass ceiling. Is this ceiling higher for the artists?

### Bio

Carolina Rodvalho has a bachelor's degree in Art History at Universidad Complutense de Madrid, and a master's degree in History of Contemporary Art and Visual Culture at Universidad Complutense de Madrid and Museo Nacional Centro de Arte Reina Sofía.

She has worked at the Museo Arqueológico Nacional in the Medieval Antiquities Conservation Department; at the Museo Nacional Centro de Arte Reina Sofía in the Strategic Development and Business Department; at the Galería Alarcón Criado as Assistant's director during art fairs; and at Flexiguías audioguías as audio guides writer.

Rodvalho published *Políticas de muerte, arte de muerte*, a publication with Centro de Arte Dos de Mayo.

# The Legal Regime of The Purchase and Sale of Works of Art, Due Diligence and the Rights of the Artists

## Restitutions and Art Markets in the Global South: Analyzing the Implications of the Sarr-Savoy Report for African Art Markets

Sarah Hegenbart ▪ Technical University, Munich, Germany

Philipp Nuernberger ▪ Attorney, LL.M., New York, USA

If the recommendations, which Felwine Sarr and Bénédicte Savoy made in their report published in November 2018, "The Restitution of African Cultural Heritage: Toward a New Relational Ethics", are taken seriously, a large amount of objects will soon be restituted to different African states. While – depending on the way in which they were taken from the source country – some objects might be restituted immediately, others will only be restituted under the condition that institutions and legal frameworks are implemented in the source country to guarantee that these objects remain accessible to the general public. This study will interrogate how restitutions will affect local art markets in African states. According to a declaration cited by Sarr and Savoy "over 90% of the material cultural legacy of sub-Saharan Africa remains preserved and housed outside of the African continent". In light of this, restitutions might also be attractive to private collectors and might result in a boost to local African markets. This raises the question of whether restituted objects will be in danger of disappearing from the public eye due to increasing market demands. If local institutions might not be able to afford the care, protection and maintenance of restituted objects, will they have to sell some of these objects in order to guarantee the care of others? To what extent do private collectors pursue an interest in gaining access to these objects? With joint interdisciplinary forces in art history and law, our study aims to tackle questions such as the following: (1) Who are potential collectors of African objects to be restituted from Europe and what are their motives (e.g. are they intending to exhibit these objects for a general public or will they lock them away in private collections?); (2) do local markets for African objects earmarked for restitution already exist and if not, where might such markets most likely emerge?; (3) what legal instruments can be envisioned to incentivize or even guarantee that restituted objects remain accessible for a general public rather than disappearing in private collections?; and (4) in what ways can we strengthen a type of relational legislation and jurisdiction to accompany and safeguard the implementation of the envisioned relational ethics?

### Bio's

Dr. Sarah Hegenbart is a lecturer in History of Art and Architecture at the Technical University Munich. Her current research project *Diagnosing post-truth politics: Dialogical art and black aesthetics* interrogates normative claims of transcultural artworks against the backdrop of philosophical approaches rooted in the Global South. Prior to her current post, Sarah completed her doctorate at the Courtauld Institute of Art in London. Her dissertation, *From Bayreuth to Burkina Faso: Christoph Schlingensiefel's Opera Village Africa as postcolonial Gesamtkunstwerk?*, explored Opera Village as a testing ground for a critical interrogation of Richard Wagner's notion of the Gesamtkunstwerk. Sarah also holds an M.St. in Ancient Philosophy from the University of Oxford and a Magister in Philosophy and History of Art from the Humboldt University of Berlin.

Philipp A. Nuernberger, LL.M. (NYU), is an attorney based in New York City with a focus on cross-border transactions. His interest in art and the art market has led him to work on a range of art-related issues such as art transactions, art market-specific and general compliance matters, copyright issues, and art-related alternative dispute resolution (including around questions of restitution of Nazi-looted art). Philipp has studied law in Germany, France, and the US and has passed both the German and the New York State bar examinations. He has worked in Germany, France, the UK, and the US.

## The Concept of Due Diligence for Cultural Property Transactions in the 1995 UNIDROIT and 1970 UNESCO Conventions

Alicja Jagielska-Burduk ▪ UNESCO Chair on Cultural Property Law, University of Opole, Poland  
Claudia Quiñones ▪ Attorney, Amineddoleh & Associates, New York, USA

The concept of due diligence in the cultural property context was first introduced in the 1995 UNIDROIT Convention on Stolen or Illegally Exported Cultural Objects. Here, UNIDROIT offered a new private law restitution model with no independent legislative implementation needed. The Convention's Art. 4 states that a purchaser must prove he exercised due diligence when acquiring the stolen exported cultural object in order to receive compensation. However, its influence goes far beyond the convention's scope, as it is tied to the notion of good faith and other related concepts in the art market.

The aim of this presentation is to examine the presence of the notion of due diligence in both international law and soft law (legal and ethical dimensions), and conclude with a clear picture of the role due diligence occupies in the art market. Due diligence does not only play a part in ensuring future safe and legitimate sales, but is also a pivotal tool in countering the illicit traffic of cultural property. Some remarks will be given on the reactions of different stakeholders regarding the UNIDROIT ratifications, as well as an assessment of the UNIDROIT Convention and the 1970 UNESCO Convention on the Means of Prohibiting and Preventing the Illicit Import, Export and Transport of Ownership of Cultural Property as complementary legal developments with the notion of due diligence. We will also address whether due diligence should be implemented in national legislation or whether the self-regulation of the art market would be sufficient, given the different legal regimes and parties involved.

### Bio's

Alicja Jagielska-Burduk, (PhD, MBA, legal counsellor), UNESCO Chair in Cultural Property Law at the Faculty of Law and Administration, University of Opole. She is the co-founder and editor-in-chief of the Santander Art and Culture Law Review and TIAMSA Legal co-chair. She specializes in cultural management, encompassing the issues of participation and access to culture and cultural heritage. In the course of her research and legal practice she has gained considerable expertise in the culture sector, including focus group analysis in relation to various stakeholders and groups of interest. In 2014, the government of Poland nominated her as a mediator at the UNESCO Intergovernmental Committee for Promoting the Return of Cultural Property to Its Countries of Origin or Its Restitution in Case of Illicit Appropriation.

Claudia S. Quiñones Vilá (LL.M., Attorney) is a licensed attorney in New York and Puerto Rico, focusing on art, cultural property, and cultural heritage law. She currently represents the Greek Ministry of Culture in a New York case ranked among the top art law disputes of 2018 by Artsy. Recently, Ms. Quiñones completed a prestigious internship at UNIDROIT under the supervision of Ms. Marina Schneider in the Cultural Property team, and secured legal traineeships at top art law

firms in Milan and London for 2019. In addition to her experience with art and cultural heritage law, she has performed extensive research and submitted a graduate thesis on cultural heritage protection legislation and public policy in the EU, Italy, Spain, and the UK. Ms. Quiñones also works as an English language editor for the Santander Art and Culture Law Review and as a Social Media Volunteer for Heritage Times by Europeana, as well as being a member of the TIAMSA legal group.

## Inadequacy and Insufficiency of Brazilian Law on Droit de Suite and the Advantages of a Universal Resale Royalty Right to the Global South

Mariana Vogelaar Carlucci • Universidade de São Paulo, Brazil

Brazil has been at the forefront of South America's artistic scenes for decades and faces an increasing global integration. Due to the economic barrier posed by elevated taxes on import of foreign art, most Brazilian collectors dedicate their collection to local artists. Nevertheless, the payment of resale rights has been at best sporadic. Brazil has recognized the 'droit de suite' in 1973. Under Brazilian law at that time, the artists were entitled to 20% of the added value calculated from the difference from the immediately preceding sale. In 1998 that percentage dropped to 5%. Moreover, it is applicable to private sales, to dealers and auction sales. This paper investigates whether the Brazilian regulation of the 'droit de suite' is effective and potential advantages of a global application of resale rights for emerging economies.

Specifically, this article points to the lack of information, or the information deficit, as a major obstacle to the enforcement of the collection of resale royalties. As a result, the 'droit de suite' is frequently ignored. Therefore, some proposals are here made on how one might deal with this problem. In doing so, this paper follows a dialectic approach combined with comparative legal research in order to evaluate the adoption and regulation of the institute in jurisdictions where it has been fully effective.

The approach adopted by Brazilian law is inadequate and insufficient to properly guarantee artists resale royalty rights. Moreover, the adoption of a universal artist resale royalty right would be a path to achieve transparency of the art market and would also support the development of adequate infrastructures in order to operate effective resale royalty rights schemes for emerging countries in the global south. The most promising solution to the lack of information is the establishment of integrated digital registration systems.

### Bio

Bachelor in Law from the University of São Paulo, Brazil. Thesis: "The Elgin Marbles and the challenge posted by the debates on repatriation of works of art and antiquity: the conflict between cultural nationalism and internationalism". Advisor: Alessandro Hirata. Study abroad program with emphasis in Arts and Law at the Università di Bologna, Italy. Courses attended: "Diritto dei paesi asiatici" (Law of Asian Countries) and "Storia dell'Arte Moderna" (History of Modern Art). Participated on the oral and written rounds of the Foreign Direct Investment Moot Court Competition in Frankfurt, Germany (2013). Undergraduate research on Disregard Doctrine sponsored by Santander. Advisor: Luciano de Camargo Penteado. Events organization: Symposium of Law and Art (2014). Attended the First International Conference on Art and Law in Brazil, which took place in João Pessoa - PB (May, 2018) and also the Art Law and Litigation Conference in New York, United States (February, 2019). Currently, Pedagogy student at the University of São Paulo, Brazil. Participates in groups of study on international trade at the University of Sao Paulo, Brazil, and develops individual researches on international commerce and art law. Areas of interest: law and art, intellectual property, international law, trade law, investment law.

## Private Collections and Private Museums in Polish Law

---

Żaneta Gwardzińska - UNESCO Chair on Cultural Property Law, University of Opole, Poland

This paper focuses on legal regulations of the Polish private museums sector. The Act of 21 November 1996 on Museums (Journal of Laws of 2019, item 917), hereafter referred to as the 'Act on Museums', does not regulate the issues related to private collections and private museums, leaving them to the regime of universally binding legal provisions. This means that private museums could be established as companies or private collections. Under the 'Act on Museums', museums that do not have a clearly defined legal status are treated as organizational units that work on the basis of the rules of procedure granted by an entity in consultation with the competent Minister for culture and protection of national heritage. The term 'museum' is not restricted, and therefore, commercial enterprises can also be designated as museums. What is more, every museum that falls under the 'Act on Museums' and that runs an additional business activity must register it.

Apart from discussing these constellations, this paper will also consider the classification of museums in Poland and the legal concerns involved in running private museums. An important aspect of the presentation will focus on the rules for museums that run business activities, thus distinguishing them from non-commercial private collections.

### Bio

Żaneta Gwardzińska, PhD, customs broker, collaborator of the UNESCO Chair on Cultural Property Protection Law at Opole of University, member of the International Art Market Studies Association and ICOM. Currently she works in the Cultural Heritage Department at the Polish Ministry of Culture and National Heritage. Her area of research focuses on legal issues concerning private museums, international art market. She is also an expert in personal data protection and information security in the cultural sector.

## The Crisis: Impact and Strategies

### Strategies of Collectivization:

#### Art Market Alternatives from the Global South

John Zarobell • University of San Francisco, USA

In the arts, the pressures of neoliberalism arrive in the Global South in the form of cultural districts, private museums and commercial galleries. These are features of the globalization of the market for art. There has been a broad expansion recently: artists from the Global South, but also collectors and dealers, are participating in the global art market in unprecedented ways.

But the structures of the art market have also produced a countermovement towards collectivization that is particularly relevant in the Global South. Artists from Phnom Penh to Buenos Aires have crafted alternatives to the art market that open up space for conversations and learning about contemporary art among populations who have never visited art galleries before. There are art-making collectives, but also collectives who operate in the place of market structures, with the aim of creating communities, not commerce.

One point to consider is how the market, or the state, responds to these developments. By one measure, artists who show in collectives such as San Art, in Saigon, have seen their international art market profiles soar, winning prizes and coveted gallery representation in Europe or the US. In Mexico City, Ex-Teresa Arte Actual, a cathedral space claimed by artists to realize temporary projects and avant-garde performances, was folded into the state system for the arts (INBA).

These examples raise the question: Can artists work together to generate viable alternatives to capitalism and its destructive logics? How do cooperative and collaborative organizations from the Global South provide a new inflection in the language of the global market for art?

#### Bio

John Zarobell is Associate Professor and Department Chair of International Studies at the University of San Francisco. Formerly, he held the positions of assistant curator at the San Francisco Museum of Modern Art and associate curator at the Philadelphia Museum of Art. He is a contributor to *Artsy*, *Art Practical* and the *San Francisco Art Quarterly* and he has written for numerous exhibition catalogues and has curated exhibitions of modern and contemporary art including *Manet and the Sea* (2003), *Frida Kahlo* (2008), *New Work: Ranjani Shettar* (2009), *Art in the Atrium: Kerry James Marshall* (2009) and *Indigenous Contemporary* (2015). His first book, *Empire of Landscape: Space and Ideology in French Colonial Algeria* and was published in 2010 and his next, *Art and the Global Economy*, was published with University of California Press in April 2017.

# The Double-Edged Sword of Prestige: A Network Analytic Approach to the Cooperation among Art Organizations in Bogotá's Emerging Art Scene

Annatina Aerne • University of St.Gallen, Switzerland

A rich literature discusses how art organizations gain prestige by connecting to recognized artists, and how artists gain prestige connecting to well-known galleries and museums. However, art organizations may also establish prestige by cooperating among themselves, rather than with artists. This dynamic is less analyzed.

This paper asks how organizations (galleries, foundations, museums and independent art spaces) gain prestige by cooperating among themselves. The paper highlights an aspect implicit in previous analyses, namely that prestige dynamics are also exclusive. Highly prestigious organizations may connect only among themselves, rather than to less recognized organizations. In order to analyze this facet, four types of cooperation are examined. The paper asks how prestige plays out in each of the following types of interaction: participating in the same art event, cooperating in the organization of an art event, organize a guided tour visiting multiple organizations, or exchanging artworks. The paper makes use of a unique dataset that features network and covariate data on Bogotá's art organizations for each year of the period between 2011 and 2015. The instances of cooperation are modeled with exponential random graph models. The findings indicate that the effect of prestige depends on the type of cooperation: collaboration does not take place across different levels of prestige in publicly more visible forms of cooperation, but it does happen in less visible interactions.

## Bio

Annatina Aerne has earned a PhD in *Organization and Culture* from the University of St. Gallen (Switzerland). Her dissertation analyzes the cooperation of art organizations in Bogotá, Colombia and was awarded the prize for the best Swiss Dissertation on the Latin American region. Previously, she earned dual degrees in economics and political science from the University of St. Gallen and the Fletcher School of Law and Diplomacy (Tufts University, Boston, US).

Her dissertation investigates the cooperation among art organizations (museums, galleries, independent art spaces and foundations) between 2011 and 2015. This period is a time of marked internationalization in the Colombian art market. Of particular interest is the question, how art organizations conjoin their publics through different forms of cooperation and thereby form a larger public sphere. Building a public sphere, in which citizens feel safe to interact, is highly relevant in the post-conflict context of Bogotá. The thesis relies on 36 expert interviews and survey data from 93 art organizations, allowing to specify the factors promoting cooperation.

Annatina Aerne continues as a post-doctoral researcher at the University of St. Gallen. Currently, she investigates the internationalization of collective skill formation, referring to educational programs that combine learning in a classroom and firms.

## A Study on Art Funds in China: Features, Values and Limits

---

Linli Li ▪ School of Art and Design, Guangdong University of Technology, China

After the financial crisis in 2008, Western investors' enthusiasm for art funds decreased significantly; however, the same period saw a dramatic increase in domestic art funds throughout major Chinese cities in response to the changing economic and social factors. 2010 was "the first year of Chinese art funds", during which China replaced the West as the center of art funds in the world. Chinese art funds exhibit a few unique characteristics which differentiate them from western funds. Art funds have positive values in helping investors minimize risk and gain both financial and non-financial benefits. However, there are also limits in terms of performance records, symbolic capital, and participants in art funds. As the combination of art and finance, art funds have intrinsic paradoxes between price authority and intrinsic value, instrumental rationality and changing tastes, as well as economic interests and artistic moral, which deserve full attention and further research.

### Bio

Linli Li is an Assistant Professor of Art Theory in the School of Art and Design at Guangdong University of Technology in China. Her research interests are art theory, art market, culture economics and aesthetics of design. Linli got her PhD degree in 2017 from Southeast University in China, and her dissertation titled "Art Funds in Global Art Market". She is a contributor to the *Grove Dictionary of Art Markets* on the entry "Beijing Poly International Auction Company", published by Oxford University Press in 2017. She also published more than 10 academic articles in Chinese.

## Mola: Documenting Artist-Run Spaces

Vera Carmo ▪ Colégio das Artes da Universidade de Coimbra (UC); Instituto Universitário da Maia (ISMAI), Portugal

Even though Porto is the second Portuguese city, the local art market can be easily dismissed as a one-way street (Rua Miguel Bombarda). However, since the turn of the century, artist-run spaces and other independent structures have flourished – and still do –, scattered around, hidden in downtown's affordable streets or in the city's outskirts. Warehouses, garages, store windows, apartments, office rooms, etc., serve as the debut stage for contemporary art in Porto and as the first step in the circulation of art works.

When compared to commercial and institutional venues, the large number of independent spaces is quite stunning, and even more so if framed within the narrow area that contains the city centre. This phenomenon finds its earlier explanation in a decrease of investment in Culture by the city's administration, between 2002 and 2013 – aggravated from 2008 onwards by the worldwide economic crisis – to which artists strategically responded by opening their own spaces. What started as a survival strategy soon turned into a trend and the number of independent art spaces in Porto continues to grow. Nowadays many of these spaces are run by foreign young artists who, attracted by the glamorous image that the city conquered in the international media, are moving to and settling in Porto.

Furthermore, the success of such venues can also be explained by the fact that their nature allows the overcoming of the limitations that the commercial galleries impose on the nature of the works of art that they sell by turning down works which do not present themselves as commodities or which are made by artists who have not yet been acknowledged in the art world.

This paper presents *Mola*, a quarterly publication devoted to the survey, documentation and promotion of Porto's independent art spaces. Drawing on interviews with founders and curators in charge of each independent space, *Mola* explores operating and survival strategies and promotes an historical panorama of the undeniable role played by artist-run spaces as the bedrock of the local art scene.

### Bio

Vera Carmo is an independent curator and co-editor of *Mola* magazine, a quarterly publication dedicated to the artist-run spaces in Porto. Currently holds a researcher position at Oporto School of Fine Arts (FBAUP) and is a professor at University of Maia (ISMAI, Maia, Portugal). From 2008 to 2010 worked as executive producer and curatorial assistant at Maumaus – Centro de Contaminação Visual (Lisbon, Portugal). She is a PHD candidate developing a thesis titled “Reenactment in Contemporary Art” (Colégio das Artes, University of Coimbra), detains a Bachelor Degree in Fine Arts / Sculpture (School of Fine Arts, University of Porto, 2004) and a Master Degree in Museology and Curatorial Studies ( School of Fine Arts, University of Porto, 2013).

## The Reinvention of the Business Model of a Major Portuguese Auction House

Luís Urbano Afonso ▪ School of Arts of the University of Lisbon, Portugal

Alexandra Fernandes ▪ ISCTE-IUL, Portugal

Loizos Petrides ▪ ISCTE-IUL, Portugal

The objective of this study is to analyze the transformation of the business model of *Cabral Moncada Leilões* (CML), currently one of the three largest Portuguese auction houses. Our analysis particularly focuses on two aspects. First, we analyze the financial performance of this auction house over a period of twelve years (2007-2018), focusing on a set of financial indicators (e.g. EBITDA, sales volume, etc.) along with some indicators that are specific to this sector (e.g., change in the average value of each lot over the years, relative weight of online sales, number of auctions per year, etc.). Secondly, we analyze the way in which this company has readjusted its business model to the profound transformations in the structure and dynamics of the art markets in Portugal (e.g., focus on online activity, reinforcement of the offer in the mid-range value market, etc.). The time span covered in this analysis is sufficient to understand the depth and nature of the transformations experienced in the economy, society and consumption habits of the Portuguese, and shows how CML was able to adapt to contingency factors in order to continue occupying a leading position in the Portuguese auction sector.

### Bio's

Luís U. Afonso is Professor at the School of Arts of the University of Lisbon (FLUL). Teaches and researches topics related to medieval art, comparative art history, iconology, and art markets. Has published several books, chapters and articles, namely at *Archivo Español de Arte*, *Artibus et Historiae*, *International Journal of Arts Management*, *Journal of World History*, *Mande Studies*, *Mediterranean Studies* and *The Medieval History Journal*.

Alexandra Fernandes holds a BSc in Corporate Finance, a MSc in Human Resources Politics and Management and a PhD in Management. She is a tenured professor in the Marketing, Operations Management and Global Management Department at ISCTE-IUL (Portugal). She is director of the BSc in Management and the MSc in Art Markets. Has published articles in international and national scientific journals and academic books.

Loizos Petrides is Assistant Professor of management in the Marketing, Operations Management and Global Management Department at ISCTE-IUL (Portugal). He has both BA and MA in Economics, an MSc in Finance and a PhD in Management with a specialization in strategy and entrepreneurship. His current research interests include strategic management for cultural organizations and cultural entrepreneurship.